

PROCEEDINGS OF THE CITY COMMISSION
CITY OF EAST GRAND RAPIDS

Regular Meeting Held January 6, 2020

Mayor Favale called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m. in the City Commission Chambers at the East Grand Rapids Community Center and led the audience in the Pledge of Allegiance.

Present: Commissioners Arendshorst, Hamrick, Pachla, Walters and Mayor Favale

Absent: Commissioner Duncan

Also Present: City Attorney Huff; Interim City Manager LaFave; Finance Director Mushong; City Clerk Brower; Parks & Recreation Director Bunn

2020-01. The agenda was approved as issued.

2020-02. Emily Beggs, 1649 Seminole, requested the city repair sidewalk stones that have been lifted by tree roots and requested additional dog waste bags and trash receptacles around the city. Interim City Manager LaFave explained the city repaired or replaced sidewalks in rotating zones each year and asked that residents contact the Public Works Department if they notice hazardous conditions.

2020-03. Commissioner Arendshorst thanked the Public Works Department for their work maintaining the streets and infrastructure of the city.

Commissioner Walters thanked all those who had applied for the 1st ward commissioner position and noted the Personnel Committee would be reviewing the applications soon.

Commissioner Pachla reminded everyone of the Christmas tree pickup and added leaf collection scheduled through January 17. Interim City Manager LaFave noted that leaves must be in paper bags or reusable containers and cannot be raked into the street.

Mayor Favale noted the flashing crosswalk beacon has been installed at the high school and looked forward to hearing feedback from motorists and pedestrians.

2020-04. Discussion of January 20, 2020 meeting date.

2020-04-A. Walters-Hamrick. That the City Commission meeting scheduled for Monday, January 20 be moved to Tuesday, January 21 at 6:00 p.m. to avoid conflict with the Martin Luther King Jr. holiday.

Commissioner Walters asked that the commission meeting schedule reflect this same change in future years.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Hamrick, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 5

Nays: -0-

2020-05. Hamrick-Pachla. To approve the consent agenda as follows:

2020-05-A. Minutes of the regular meeting held December 16, 2019.

2020-05-B. Payroll disbursements of \$623,255.68; county and school disbursements of \$419,102.69, and total remaining disbursements of \$423,845.56.

2020-05-C. A contract with Arrowaste, Inc. of Jenison through 2024 for refuse and recycling services for city facilities as outlined in the Interim City Manager's memo dated December 9, 2019.

2020-05-D. A contract with the City of Grand Rapids for maintenance of electronic traffic control devices as attached in Exhibit "A."

Yeas: Arendshorst, Hamrick, Pachla, Walters, and Favale – 5
Nays: -0-

2020-06. Walters-Hamrick. Motion to enter into an executive session to discuss personnel matters, collective bargaining agreements and the acquisition of real estate in accordance with Sections 8(a), 8(c) and 8(d) of the Open Meetings Act. A roll call vote was taken.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Hamrick, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 5
Nays: -0-

The meeting adjourned at 6:12 p.m., subject to the call of the Mayor until January 21, 2020.

Karen K. Brower, City Clerk

Attachments: A – Traffic Signal Agreement with City of Grand Rapids

Attachments listed above are available for inspection at the office of the City Clerk.

PROCEEDINGS OF THE CITY COMMISSION
CITY OF EAST GRAND RAPIDS

Rescheduled Regular Meeting Held January 21, 2020

Mayor Favale called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m. in the City Commission Chambers at the East Grand Rapids Community Center and led the audience in the Pledge of Allegiance.

Present: Commissioners Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Pachla, Walters and Mayor Favale

Absent: None

Also Present: City Attorney Huff; Interim City Manager LaFave; Finance Director Mushong; City Clerk Brower; Parks & Recreation Director Bunn; Public Safety Director Herald; Captain Buikema; School Liaison Officer Wallace; Zoning Administrator Mizikar

2020-07. Mayor Favale suggested amending the agenda to only interview 1st ward applicants tonight and to delay the appointment decision until the next meeting. Everyone agreed to this change.

2020-08. Emily Beggs, 1649 Seminole, reported she had received several positive comments on Facebook regarding the flashing pedestrian beacon on Lake Drive at Bagley. She requested that additional beacons be placed at Lake Grove/Hall Street and on Lakeside Drive at the library crosswalk. Ms. Beggs also noted that there is growing concern about safety during the middle school dropoff/pickup times.

Tom Tilma, 1635 Hall, listed several places he felt snow had not been adequately cleared following the recent storm, including hydrants, bus stops, sidewalks, bike racks and bike lanes, and asked these tasks be finished.

2020-09. Commissioners Pachla and Arendshorst thanked the Public Works Department for handling the 10" of snow received over the weekend.

Commissioner Duncan reported she had ridden along with the plow drivers on Saturday and had a new appreciation for what it takes to clear snow during heavy storms.

Commissioner Walters thanked his fellow commissioners for rescheduling tonight's meeting to allow participation in events commemorating the Martin Luther King, Jr. holiday yesterday.

Mayor Favale announced the Parks & Recreation Dept. would be hosting a volunteer event on Saturday from 9 am to noon to remove Buckthorn, an invasive species, from Waterfront Park.

2020-10. A zoning variance hearing was held regarding the request of Brandon Schad of 3159 Lake Drive to allow the construction of an attached garage creating a front yard setback of 51'4" instead of the required 85'6."

Zoning Administrator Mizikar explained the request to replace and enlarge the garage and living areas with an addition that will make the house closer to the street. He noted other homes were built on either side after this property was developed and were placed much further back from the street, creating an average setback of 85'6," meaning any addition to this home would require a variance due to the ordinance requiring the use of the average setback.

Brandon Schad, 3159 Lake Drive, and Brian Barkwell of Via Design, were present to answer questions.

Mayor Favale opened a public hearing. The following people were present to express their opinions:

- Charles Panter, 3131 Lake Drive Supported the variance request.

No other public comment was received. Mayor Favale closed the public hearing.

- 2020-10-A. Walters-Hamrick. That the request of Brandon Schad of 3159 Lake Drive to allow the construction of an attached garage creating a front yard setback of 51'4" instead of the required 85'6" be approved as outlined in the Zoning Administrator memo contained in the agenda materials.

Commissioner Walters questioned whether the ordinance should be reviewed to address situations like this one. Interim City Manager LaFave noted this was not a common situation and didn't feel it would occur very often.

Commissioner Walters felt each condition for granting variances was met with this request. He noted it was a peculiar situation due to the deep lots and setbacks much greater than required. He noted the applicant did not create the situation and felt the addition would not be detrimental to other properties due to distance and landscaping.

Commissioner Hamrick agreed and noted the home was not part of the Ravenswood plot. She stated the situation was not the applicant's fault and the addition wouldn't affect neighbors because of the mature trees.

Commissioner Pachla reiterated that any addition would require a variance due to the average setback, but he felt the addition would be well shielded from the sidewalk and other homes.

Mayor Favale also supported the addition due to the landscaping. She felt having the home 9' closer to the street was not significant and the neighbors supported the project.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 6
Nays: -0-

- 2020-11. Interviews and Appointment of 1st Ward City Commissioner.

Lawrence Fisher detailed his years of community involvement as a counselor and coach for the schools as well as working with the Parks & Recreation Department on parks improvements. He expressed interest in working on additional park projects, city/school partnerships and keeping the community safe and vibrant.

Bradley Hecksel outlined his experiences with the Down Syndrome Association and Leadership Grand Rapids. He noted the implementation and funding for the Master Plan, the Parks & Recreation plan projects and activating vacant space in the business district would be important future projects.

Melissa Janes spoke about her many years in East GR, her non-profit work and visions for the community. She listed her priorities as service to the citizens, financial health, active implementation of the master plan, and finding ways to engage citizens and stakeholders to create a better downtown.

Mayor Favale thanked everyone who applied for this position and looked forward to selecting a new commissioner at the next meeting.

- 2020-12. Introduction of an ordinance to amend Section 9.56 of Chapter 93 of Title IX of the City Code pertaining to the age limit for tobacco products.

City Attorney Huff explained the federal laws had recently changed raising the age to purchase, possess and use tobacco products to age 21. This ordinance amendment changes our local ordinances to match the federal laws.

- 2020-12-A. Walters-Arendshorst. That an ordinance to amend Section 9.56 of Chapter 93 of Title IX of the City Code pertaining to the age limit for tobacco products be introduced as attached in Exhibit "A."

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 6
Nays: -0-

2020-13. Public Safety quarterly meeting schedule and topics.

Public Safety Director Herald outlined the department's plan to hold quarterly community engagement sessions to discuss police procedures, home and personal safety, traffic concerns, and other topics. Sessions will give citizens a chance to meet the officers, ask questions and review data and studies.

2020-13-A. Duncan-Hamrick. To approve the concept of quarterly public meetings with the Public Safety Department and the first meeting of January 30, 2020.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 6

Nays: -0-

2020-14. Duncan-Arendshorst. To approve the consent agenda as follows:

2020-14-A. Minutes of the regular meeting held January 6, 2020.

2020-14-B. Payroll disbursements of \$217,515.35; county and school disbursements of \$982,287.86, and total remaining disbursements of \$215,260.09.

2020-14-C. A three-year contract with Romence Gardens for streetscape plantings in the amount of \$11,490.00 for 2020, \$11,867.00 in 2021 and \$12,123.00 in 2022.

2020-14-D. A cost sharing agreement with the City of Grand Rapids for engineering services and construction of Hall Street in 2021 from Sylvan Avenue to 1275 east of Plymouth and authorization of funds for the estimated East Grand Rapids costs of \$100,462.00 as attached in Exhibit "A."

2020-14-E. The addition of a head lifeguard/shift supervisor classification and related pay scale for the seasonal wage schedule for the Parks & Recreation Department.

2020-14-F. The preliminary minutes of the Parks & Recreation Commission meeting held December 9, 2019.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Pachla, Walters, and Favale – 6

Nays: -0-

2020-15. The City Commission and staff discussed the current ordinance which expires in June 2020 that prohibits recreational marijuana businesses. Interim City Manager LaFave explained State regulations include a 1,000' buffer from school properties, meaning there are not any commercially-zoned properties in East Grand Rapids where a marijuana business could be located. The city commission discussed whether to go through the process of crafting ordinances, regulations and licensing procedures when there are currently no properties where the sale of marijuana products would be feasible. It was noted that having an ordinance banning the sale of marijuana does not impact an individual's right to use marijuana on private property. The commission discussed possible marijuana retail locations in Grand Rapids and whether this would impact residential neighborhoods along the border. They asked staff to communicate with Grand Rapids and ask that consideration be given to residential properties near allowed locations, even if the residences are in other municipalities. The commission directed staff to prepare ordinance amendments for consideration to remove the expiration date from Chapter 79C prohibiting the sale of marijuana products. This will be placed on an upcoming commission agenda.

City Attorney Huff noted that federal laws address vaping in the same manner as other cigarette and tobacco products, while most state and local laws have not yet been extended to vaping. He reviewed a draft ordinance that would add definitions, prohibitions for persons under 21, penalties, etc. Although enforcement could be done under state or federal laws, having a local ordinance would give the city more control over enforcement and provide revenue from penalties. Commissioners preferred to wait and see if the schools had any input on this matter and see what comes from state efforts to limit or ban vaping products.

Finance Director Mushong reviewed property tax administration fees charged by other municipalities, current millages collected for other entities and other questions from the last work session. She reported that MERS had reevaluated our pension funding schedule at our request and had offered an extended payment plan that significantly lowered the payments for the next few years, which will certainly help with the financial forecast. The commission agreed to move forward with accepting the new funding schedule and to continue discussions for long-term revenue, expenditure and pension-funding options.

The meeting adjourned at 8:26 p.m., subject to the call of the Mayor until February 3, 2020.

Karen K. Brower, City Clerk

Attachments: A – Hall Street Cost Sharing Agreement with City of Grand Rapids

Attachments listed above are available for inspection at the office of the City Clerk.

UNOFFICIAL
Reference Only

PROCEEDINGS OF THE CITY COMMISSION
CITY OF EAST GRAND RAPIDS

Regular Meeting Held February 3, 2020

Mayor Favale called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m. in the City Commission Chambers at the East Grand Rapids Community Center and led the audience in the Pledge of Allegiance.

Present: Commissioners Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Pachla, Walters and Mayor Favale

Absent: None

Also Present: City Attorney Huff; Interim City Manager LaFave; Finance Director Mushong; City Clerk Brower; Parks & Recreation Director Bunn

2020-16. Mayor Favale asked that a resolution concerning the MERS pension system be added to the agenda.

2020-16-A. Arendshorst-Pachla. Motion to add to the agenda a resolution to approve the reallocation of assets within the Municipal Employees' Retirement System of Michigan. A roll call vote was taken.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 6

Nays: -0-

The agenda was accepted as revised.

2020-17. Laura St. Louis extended an invitation to the Disability Awareness Day hosted by Disability Advocates of Kent County on March 27.

Brandon Sinclair, candidate for 73rd District State Representative, introduced himself and gave his contact information for anyone interested in speaking with him.

2020-18. Commissioner Pachla reminded everyone of the Lower Grand River Organization of Watersheds (LGROW) program asking people to “adopt a drain” and asked everyone to assist in clearing storm drains of debris.

Mayor Favale noted city commission meetings would soon be streamed on YouTube instead of on Facebook.

2020-19. Appointment of First Ward Commissioner.

Commissioner Pachla stated he was extremely pleased with the response to the vacancy posting and had enjoyed meeting all of the applicants. He spoke in favor of appointing Brad Hecksel due to his skillset and understanding of the master plan.

Commissioner Duncan agreed all those interviewed were impressive in their presentations. She also supported Mr. Hecksel because of his real estate experience that gave him an understanding of the city's neighborhoods and because of his stance on housing.

Commissioner Arendshorst also liked Mr. Hecksel's outline of housing issues and focus on the mobility plan.

Commissioner Walters stated he could support any of the three finalists but spoke of his personal appreciation of Mr. Fisher's longer tenure in the city, his community activism and the time he can devote to the position.

Commissioner Hamrick preferred Brad Hecksel's understanding of zoning and housing issues and experience as a construction estimator, which she felt would be helpful during future redevelopment discussions.

Mayor Favale again thanked all those who applied for the position and hoped everyone could find a way to be involved in committees or groups in the future. She also spoke in favor of appointing Mr. Hecksel as she felt he helped fill a gap in the commission.

Commissioner Walters thanked Mrs. Janes for the time she spent preparing for the interview and her extensive community involvement.

2020-19-A. Hamrick-Duncan. That Brad Hecksel of 1103 Eastwood be appointed as commissioner for the first ward for the remainder of the term expiring December 6, 2021.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 6
Nays: -0-

2020-20. Final Reading of an ordinance to amend Section 9.56 of Chapter 93 of Title IX of the City Code pertaining to the age limit for tobacco products.

City Attorney Huff explained this ordinance amendment would match new federal laws.

2020-20-A. Walters-Arendshorst. That an ordinance to amend Section 9.56 of Chapter 93 of Title IX of the City Code pertaining to the age limit for tobacco products be adopted as attached in Exhibit “A.”

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 6
Nays: -0-

2020-21. Authorization to proceed with spring road and infrastructure projects.

Interim City Manager LaFave outlined the various road construction and maintenance projects planned for the upcoming season and answered questions from the city commission.

2020-21-A. Pachla-Hamrick. That the Public Works Department be authorized to solicit bids and award contracts with qualified low bidders through the Kent County Road Commission contracts for cape seal and micro-surface treatments up to approved budgeted amounts as outlined in the Interim City Manager’s memo dated January 22, 2020.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 6
Nays: -0-

2020-22. Contract for Mobility/Bicycle Action Plan.

Interim City Manager LaFave explained the Infrastructure Committee had interviewed both firms who submitted proposals and felt both were well qualified and would produce excellent plans. Commissioners Duncan and Hamrick also gave their impressions of the firms and noted they were comfortable with the lowest cost proposal.

Mr. LaFave noted the timeline will be determined in the next few weeks and communicated with officials and residents who are interested in participating in the public sessions.

Commissioners Arendshorst and Walters both noted they would be abstaining from the vote due to their firm’s client relationship with one of the companies.

2020-22-A. Duncan-Hamrick. That a contract be awarded to Progressive AE in an amount not to exceed \$35,500 for services and related expenses for a Mobility-Bike Action Plan.

Yeas: Duncan, Hamrick, Pachla and Favale – 4
Nays: -0-
Abstain: Arendshorst, Walters – 2

2020-23. Discussion of Spring Break meeting.

2020-23-A. Walters-Hamrick. That the regular meeting of April 6, 2020 be rescheduled to Monday, March 30, 2020 at 6 p.m. to ensure a quorum.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 6
Nays: -0-

2020-24. Resolution authorizing reallocation of assets.

Finance Director Mushong explained there were different divisions within our MERS accounts and asked the commission to approve the reallocation of assets from overfunded sections to underfunded sections.

2020-24-A. Pachla-Hamrick. That a resolution approving the reallocation of assets within the Municipal Employees' Retirement System accounts from overfunded divisions to underfunded divisions be approved as attached in Exhibit "B."

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 6
Nays: -0-

2020-25. Duncan-Arendshorst. To approve the consent agenda as follows:

2020-25-A. Minutes of the rescheduled regular meeting held January 21, 2020.

2020-25-B. Payroll disbursements of \$220,369.50; county and school disbursements of \$297,552.78, and total remaining disbursements of \$441,191.06.

2020-25-C. Contracts with Moore and Bruggink Inc. and Halverson Engineering up to approved budgeted amounts for engineering services relating to road and utility infrastructure through March 31, 2023.

2020-25-D. The purchase of a large-format scanner for the Public Works Department from Engineering Supply and Imaging in the amount of \$6,075.00.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Pachla, Walters, and Favale – 6
Nays: -0-

The meeting adjourned at 6:46 p.m., subject to the call of the Mayor until February 17, 2020.

Karen K. Brower, City Clerk

Attachments: A – Ordinance amendment to Section 9.56 raising the age limit for tobacco products.
B __ Resolution authorizing reallocation of MERS assets

Attachments listed above are available for inspection at the office of the City Clerk.

PROCEEDINGS OF THE CITY COMMISSION
CITY OF EAST GRAND RAPIDS

Regular Meeting Held February 17, 2020

Mayor Favale called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m. in the City Commission Chambers at the East Grand Rapids Community Center and led the audience in the Pledge of Allegiance.

Present: Commissioners Duncan, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Mayor Favale

Absent: Arendshorst and Hamrick

Also Present: City Attorney Huff; Interim City Manager LaFave; Finance Director Mushong; City Clerk Brower; Public Safety Director Herald

2020-26. The agenda was accepted without changes.

2020-27. No public comment was received.

2020-28. Commissioner Pachla reminded everyone that the Kent County recycling facility was closed for renovations so residents should hold on to their recycling until mid-March when the facility reopens.

Mayor Favale announced the meeting was being streamed on YouTube with equipment donated by the East Grand Rapids Community Foundation.

2020-29. Minutes of the regular meeting held February 3, 2020.

2020-29-A. Duncan-Pachla. To approve the minutes of the regular meeting held February 3, 2020.

Yeas: Duncan, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 4

Nays: -0-

2020-30. Approval of disbursements.

2020-30-A. Walters-Duncan. To approve payroll disbursements of \$221,083.63; county and school disbursements of \$197,940.55, and total remaining disbursements of \$324,136.15.

Yeas: Duncan, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 4

Nays: -0-

2020-31. City Clerk Brower administered the oath of office to First Ward City Commissioner Bradley Hecksel. Commissioner Hecksel then took his seat on the City Commission.

2020-32. Introduction of an ordinance to amend Chapter 79C of Title VII of the City Code pertaining to recreational marijuana facilities and establishments.

City Attorney Huff explained this amendment would restate Chapter 79C with identical language except for the removal of the expiration date. Mr. Huff noted that the 1,000-foot buffer from schools contained in the state guidelines for licensing covers all properties in the commercial district, meaning there are no locations where retail facilities could be located in East Grand Rapids. He stated that individual rights to purchase marijuana products elsewhere and to use those products on private property would not be affected by the ordinance.

Commissioner Walters stated it did not seem prudent to reduce the state recommended 1,000-foot radius from school facilities. He reiterated that this ordinance only affected retail sales in East Grand Rapids and did not affect the individual rights allowed by state law to purchase products in nearby areas.

Commissioner Pachla supported the ordinance amendment and felt it was important to protect the staff time and resources that would be spent in further research and licensing development when there were no allowable areas in East Grand Rapids outside the 1,000-foot zone.

Mayor Favale opened this issue for public comment. No other public comment was received. Mayor Favale closed the public comment.

2020-32-A. Duncan-Pachla. That an ordinance to amend Chapter 79C of Title VII of the City Code pertaining to recreational marijuana facilities and establishments be introduced as attached in Exhibit "A."

Yeas: Duncan, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 5
Nays: -0-

2020-33. Pachla-Duncan. To approve the consent agenda as follows:

2020-33-A. Resolution adopting budget amendments for the period ending December 31, 2019 as attached in Exhibit "B."

2020-33-B. Lease and purchase agreements for copiers and printers with Konica Minolta for print/copy services and the replacement of all existing copiers/printers with a lease option.

2020-33-C. An engagement letter with Foster Swift for legal services relating to the defined benefit pension plan.

2020-33-D. Advisory board and committee assignments for city commissioners for the remainder of the 2020-21 term as proposed by the Mayor.

Yeas: Duncan, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 5
Nays: -0-

The meeting adjourned at 6:14 p.m., subject to the call of the Mayor until March 2, 2020.

Karen K. Brower, City Clerk

Attachments: A – Ordinance amendment to Chapter 79C relating to recreational marijuana.
B – Resolution adopting budget amendments.

Attachments listed above are available for inspection at the office of the City Clerk.

PROCEEDINGS OF THE CITY COMMISSION
CITY OF EAST GRAND RAPIDS

Regular Meeting Held March 2, 2020

Mayor Favale called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m. in the City Commission Chambers at the East Grand Rapids Community Center and led the audience in the Pledge of Allegiance.

Present: Commissioners Arendshorst, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Mayor Favale

Absent: Commissioner Duncan

Also Present: City Attorney Huff; Interim City Manager LaFave; Finance Director Mushong; Parks & Recreation Director Bunn; City Clerk Brower; Captain Buikema; Officer Wallace; Officer Hollis; Communications Specialist Licari

2020-34. The agenda was accepted without changes.

2020-35. No public comment was received.

2020-36. Commissioner Hecksel noted he was excited for his first full meeting and looked forward to learning more about operations and issues.

Commissioner Arendshorst invited everyone to attend the performances of Frozen Jr. at Lakeside Elementary this weekend.

Commissioner Walters reminded everyone to vote in the Michigan Presidential Primary on March 10 and to contact the city offices for information on voting or spoiling ballots.

Mayor Favale encouraged anyone interested in receiving communications from the city to go to eastgr.org and sign up for the e-newsletter and emails on other topics of interest.

2020-37. Pablo Majano from the Michigan Economic Development Corporation (MEDC) reviewed the baseline report for the East Grand Rapids Redevelopment Ready Community certification. He outlined the best practice areas that are measured and looked forward to working with East Grand Rapids to complete the final steps to receive the certification.

2020-38. Request to approve the division of land at 1549 Lake Grove.

Zoning Administrator Mizikar explained the request to create a new buildable lot behind the existing home. He stated that no variance is required for the lot with the home because it is already non-conforming due to the slightly narrower lot. Both lots will be average size for the neighborhood and all other standards are met. Mr. Mizikar recommended the lot split be conditioned on the relocation or removal of sheds on the new parcel to meet requirements.

Scott Bolinder, 1549 Lake Grove, stated they may not sell the new lot immediately, but want to know what the options are. He stated he had sent out letters to surrounding neighbors seeking feedback.

Mayor Favale opened a public hearing. No other public comment was received. Mayor Favale closed the public hearing.

2020-38-A. Walters-Hamrick. That the request of Scott and Jill Bolinder, owners of 1549 Lake Grove, to divide the property into two conforming parcels with Parcel "A" fronting on Albert Drive with a width of 72' and a total area of 7,232 square feet, and Parcel "B," containing the existing home, to front on Lake Grove with a width of 69.8' and total area of 9,403 square feet be approved, with the following conditions:

1. The split complies with the surveys and legal descriptions presented in the land division application;
2. The relevant deed(s) or land contract(s) be recorded with the Kent County Registrar of Deeds within 90 days of approval; and
3. All accessory structures must be moved into conforming locations on the remaining parcel before the split is recorded with the Registrar of Deeds.

Commissioner Walters agreed with Zoning Administrator Mizikar's written analysis of the proposal and stated this new lot would be comparable in size and shape to others in the area.

Commissioner Hamrick stated this was an appropriate split in size for the area and looked forward to having another new family in the area.

Mayor Favale also agreed that the standards were met and there were no issues with this land division.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 6

Nays: -0-

- 2020-39. Final Reading of an ordinance to amend Chapter 79C of Title VII of the City Code pertaining to recreational marijuana facilities and establishments.

City Attorney Huff explained the amendment restates Chapter 79C with the exact same language prohibiting recreational marijuana facilities and establishments and only removes the previous expiration date. He noted this ordinance will have no impact on an individual's rights to purchase or use marijuana products but only eliminates sales due to the proximity to the school buildings in the downtown area. Mr. Huff stated that both Grand Rapids and Lowell had not only kept the 1,000' buffer zones recommended by the state, but both had added additional buffer zones from other uses and zoning districts. The 1,000 foot buffer mirrors state and federal drug-free school zone laws. He was not aware of any municipality reducing the state-recommended 1,000 buffer zones, even though the state laws allow this. Mr. Huff stated the November 2018 ballot language legalizing recreational marijuana use clearly stated that municipalities could ban or restrict marijuana sales. He also noted that this would not be a permanent prohibition as any ordinance can be changed in the future at the discretion of the city commission. He recommended adopting the ordinances without an expiration date as the future impact and revenue from marijuana sales may not be known for several years.

Interim City Manager LaFave reminded everyone that the city commission had discussed the 1,000' buffer at their January work session and agreed to keep that distance because reducing it to 500' didn't significantly change the number of properties where marijuana could be sold and still eliminated everything on Wealthy Street. He noted Gaslight Village is only three blocks and with a school in the downtown area, there were not many viable options. After the work session, staff moved forward with presenting an ordinance amendment to remove the expiration date from the ordinance language that prohibits retail sales in the Gaslight Village area.

City Attorney Huff added that allowing a dispensary or retail sales within the 1,000' drug free school zone would violate federal law and may open the business to prosecution or forced relocation.

In response to questions from the commission, Mr. Huff noted that

- Current PUD parcels would not be considered for marijuana businesses because even portions of the property outside the 1,000' are in common ownership with the portions within the 1,000' zone. It may be possible in the future to designate large parcels with some area outside the buffer zone that may qualify, but this would require additional research.
- Federal and state laws use a radius from school properties to measure the buffer zones, but other cities have used a right-of-way measurement for other buffer zones from churches, parks, etc.
- If the commission is interested in periodically reviewing the marijuana industry, impacts and revenues available, they can direct staff to conduct research and report back to the city commission at any time—an expiration date is not necessary.
- If the commission decides to allow sales in the future, it would be at least a 4-6 month process for the city to create licensing rules, ordinances and to allow sufficient time for public input and processing by both the Planning Commission and City Commission.

- If sales are allowed in the future, it is likely that PUD agreements would have to be amended or multiple properties would have to be rezoned from PUD or residential to commercial, involving discussions with entire neighborhoods.

Mayor Favale opened this issue for public comment. The following people expressed their opinions:

- Karen Machiorlatti-Waldron, 356 Gladstone #2 Please keep 1,000' buffer to protect children in this family community. Marijuana will be available close by; doesn't fit in downtown EGR. High THC levels will have greater impact than people think.
- Karla Anderson, 2006 Wealthy Do not change to allow sales in EGR. Drugs have always been an issue. Revenue isn't worth the problems or risk. People move here for the schools and to raise children; not a good fit.
- Jack Lehman, 1121 Keneberry Way Those under 21 will find a way to obtain restricted products, so relying on age restriction will not keep it from getting into the schools.
- Chris Knappe, 2530 Maplewood Feels this is an opportunity to be a model community by removing stigma from cannabis. Alcohol, opioids are also prohibited to those under 21, but remain problems. Please educate the residents and take advantage of revenues. Modern stores are not problems due to regulations and responsible shop owners. Legalization has happened; don't fear this. Suggested extending the moratorium to study how best to allow retail sales in Gaslight Village.
- Karla Anderson, 2006 Wealthy Doesn't feel it is appropriate here just because it's legal.
- Karen Machiorlatti-Waldron, 356 Gladstone #2 Reiterated that THC levels are higher than years ago. Gaslight Village is surrounded closely by residential neighborhoods, so shops would be very close to homes and children.

The following communications were received at City Hall concerning this issue:

- Gaslight Village Business Assn Opposed sale of marijuana in EGR (Dec 2018 letter).
- Nicholas Krupansky, 2450 Maplewood Allow sales due to public support for ballot proposal.
- Allison Sevensma, 3055 Manhattan Lane Supported allowing shops; will be positive for area.
- Mark Huffman, 2553 Berwyck Rd Opposed to allowing in city limits.
- Kate DeVries, 1602 Mackinaw Rd Extend sunset date and consider allowing sales.
- Scott & Natalie Bernecker, 2836 Lake Dr Keep 1,000' buffer from schools and family feel.
- Sue Keil, 1701 Amberley Ct Keep 1,000' buffer from schools and family businesses.
- Ellen Schendel & Amorak Huey, 429 Briarwood Extend the ordinance to determine right way forward.

No other public comment was received. Mayor Favale closed the public comment.

Commissioner Arendshorst felt there were still unanswered questions, such as the future of the large vacant parcel on the north side of Gaslight Village. He supported extending the expiration date to allow more time. Also supported looking at different ways to measure 1,000.'

Commissioner Walters spoke in favor of adopting the ordinance without an expiration date since the ordinance can be amended later if regulations or circumstances change. Noted the high school and the resulting 1,000' buffer would likely still exist in the future, so most properties would still be prohibited from having shops that sell marijuana. Residents voted for to support in home use but were aware that cities could limit or ban. He had no interest in reducing the 1,000' buffer in light of the federal law, so there are effectively no properties in Gaslight that could sell marijuana products at this time. He again noted that residents had voted to allow and

would be able to purchase elsewhere and use in their own homes. He felt officials should be openminded in the future and should revisit this issue sometime in the future when more information about the impacts are known.

Commissioner Hamrick wanted to extend the expiration date to allow more time to determine the future of undeveloped property and how much revenue could be gained from participating. She felt an extended expiration date was the only way to ensure the issue would be revisited.

Commissioner Hecksel noted there was a lot of divided feedback on this issue and supported extending the expiration date by 24 months to get more data and input from residents.

Commissioner Pachla agreed that using the 1,000' buffer would eliminate all commercially-zoned properties in the city at this time. He also noted that the funding structure approved in the ballot language sends the vast majority of revenues to the state and to research in the first few years, so local revenue is uncertain at best. He supported individual rights to personally use these products. He also suggested that future discussions include the school district. He supported keeping the 1,000' buffer zone and adopting the ordinance without an expiration date.

Mayor Favale agreed that reducing the 1,000' buffer zone is not an option she's comfortable with since it is part of federal law. She favored adopting the ordinance without an expiration date and then revisiting the issue in the future when more information is known about the impacts of marijuana sales. She did not feel it was appropriate to move forward at this time given the unknown impacts with the high school located in downtown.

Interim City Manager LaFave stated the commission could ask staff to bring this matter back to the commission's attention at a specific date in the future without including an expiration date in the ordinance.

2020-39-A. Arendshorst-Hamrick. That an ordinance to amend Chapter 79C of Title VII of the City Code pertaining to recreational marijuana facilities and establishments be adopted with a new expiration date of June 6, 2021.

Commissioner Hamrick noted the school board had not been able to meet before tonight's meeting to consider their position on this issue and the June 2021 date would give them time to respond.

Commissioner Walters reiterated that the issue was really about whether there was any way to allow sales given the 1,000' buffer recommended by state regulations and that if we agree that 1,000' is appropriate, there is no reason to put an expiration date in the ordinance since the buffer zone is not likely to change in the near future.

Commissioner Pachla agreed that leaving the 1,000' buffer was his preference and only a federal change in that distance or significant expansion of the business district would change his mind. He did not feel there was a need for a sunset date as the commission could place it on a future agenda for discussion at any time. He pledged to continue engaging constituents and soliciting feedback, but felt an expiration date was not needed.

Commissioner Hecksel noted he was interested in exploring options to allow sales on properties that were only partially included in the 1,000' buffer. He stated the federal drug-free school zones were only designed to increase penalties for illegal sales, not deter businesses. He favored being proactive by considering this again in one year.

Commissioner Walters felt that the small number of emails received on this issue was indicative of support for the proposed ordinance which prohibited sales in the business district at this time. Commissioner Arendshorst disagreed and felt the public may want sales in Gaslight Village.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Hamrick and Hecksel – 3
Nays: Pachla, Walters and Favale – 3

2020-39-B. Walters-Pachla. That an ordinance to amend Chapter 79C of Title VII of the City Code pertaining to recreational marijuana facilities and establishments be adopted as presented with no expiration date.

Yeas: Pachla, Walters and Favale – 3
Nays: Arendshorst, Hamrick and Hecksel – 3

City Attorney Huff suggested that if the commission eventually decided to add an expiration date that they consider a longer timeframe since marijuana shops have only now started to open to the public and little will be known for at least a few years.

Mayor Favale noted that since no decision was made tonight, this matter would be placed on the next agenda for further discussion.

2020-40. Extension of amortization agreement with Municipal Employees' Retirement Systems of Michigan.

Finance Director Mushong explained the proposal to extend the funding period from six years to ten years. Interim City Manager LaFave noted this is the first step in a short-term approach to address pension funding and the staff was researching other long-term options.

2020-40-A. Arendshorst-Hecksel. That the amortization extension with the Municipal Employees' Retirement Systems of Michigan be approved as outlined by the Finance Director in a memo and report dated January 24, 2020.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 6
Nays: -0-

2020-41. Pachla-Hamrick. To approve the consent agenda as follows:

2020-41-A. Minutes of the regular meeting held February 17, 2020.

2020-41-B. Payroll disbursements of \$228,041.92; county and school disbursements of \$615,361.08, and total remaining disbursements of \$197,166.03.

2020-41-C. A right-of-way landscaping policy as attached in Exhibit "A."

2020-41-D. Quarterly financial statements for the period ending December 31, 2019.

2020-41-E. A fireworks permit for the July 4 Celebration.

2020-41-F. Amendments to the streetlight contract with Consumers Energy for changes to the lighting at Lake Drive and Plymouth Road as attached in Exhibits "B" and "C."

Yeas: Arendshorst, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 6
Nays: -0-

2020-41-G. Pachla-Hamrick. Motion to enter into an executive session to discuss pending litigation with the city attorney in accordance with Section 8(e) of the Open Meetings Act. A roll call vote was taken.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 6
Nays: -0-

The meeting adjourned at 7:58 p.m., subject to the call of the Mayor until March 16, 2020.

Karen K. Brower, City Clerk

Attachments: A – Resolution adopting budget amendments.
B – Streetlighting Agreement with Consumers Energy
C – Streetlighting Agreement with Consumers Energy

Attachments listed above are available for inspection at the office of the City Clerk.

PROCEEDINGS OF THE CITY COMMISSION
CITY OF EAST GRAND RAPIDS

Regular Meeting Held March 16, 2020

Mayor Favale called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m. in the City Commission Chambers at the East Grand Rapids Community Center and led the audience in the Pledge of Allegiance.

Present: Commissioners Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Walters and Mayor Favale

Absent: Commissioner Pachla

Also Present: City Attorney Huff; Interim City Manager LaFave; City Clerk Brower
Communications Specialist Licari

2020-42. Mayor Favale asked that all of the regular agenda items be removed from tonight's agenda and postponed indefinitely to comply with the current guidelines discouraging public gatherings due to the COVID-19/ Coronavirus outbreak.

2020-42-A. Duncan-Walters. To remove items 5-10 from the agenda and postpone them indefinitely.

Yeas: Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Walters and Favale – 5

Nays: -0-

2020-43. Todd Astrauskas, 435 Plymouth, questioned when the postponed agenda items would be rescheduled. Interim City Manager LaFave noted that these will be rescheduled when it is safe to hold public gatherings again and encouraged those interested in those agenda items to watch the city's website and social media pages and to sign up for alerts from the city's website when new agendas as posted prior to each meeting.

2020-44. Commissioner Walters thanked those going above and beyond the call of duty right now to contain the spread of the virus and for continuing daily operations wherever possible.

Interim City Manager LaFave stated the city is adhering to the guidance from the Kent County Health Department and the Michigan Department of Health & Human Services regarding precautionary measures for gatherings, cleaning practices, etc. and has information on the website letting residents know about current closings, cancellations and resources for those who need them. He also noted the staff is encouraging people to pay bills online and call with questions instead of coming to the offices.

Commissioner Arendshorst arrived.

Mr. LaFave further noted that decisions on holding the March 30 city commission meeting would be made later in the week.

Mayor Favale thanked the staff for staying on top of all the changing information. She urged everyone to stay calm and enjoy the time at home with their families. She encouraged support of local businesses whenever possible during this time.

2020-45. Walters-Duncan. To approve the consent agenda as follows:

2020-45-A. Minutes of the regular meeting held March 2, 2020.

2020-45-B. Payroll disbursements of \$218,960.07; county and school disbursements of \$81,025.17, and total remaining disbursements of \$137,096.92.

2020-45-C. Meeting date list for FY 2020-21.

2020-45-D. Establishment of June 1, 2020 as the date to hold public hearings for the budget and for delinquent accounts and to hold a special meeting to adopt the budget on this date.

2020-45-E. The addition of a full-time position in the Finance Department to assist with front desk and assessing operations as requested by the Finance Director.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Walters and Favale – 6

Nays: -0-

The meeting adjourned at 6:10 p.m., subject to the call of the Mayor until March 30, 2020.

Karen K. Brower, City Clerk

UNOFFICIAL
Reference Only

PROCEEDINGS OF THE CITY COMMISSION
CITY OF EAST GRAND RAPIDS

Regular Meeting Held March 30, 2020

Mayor Favale called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m. in the City Commission Chambers at the East Grand Rapids Community Center and led the audience in the Pledge of Allegiance. She announced the meeting was being held mostly electronically as allowed by Executive Order 2020-15 in response to the COVID-19 crisis. She invited any citizen attending by computer or phone to ask questions or offer comments during the public comment times.

Present in Person: Mayor Favale

Present by Phone: Commissioners Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla and Walters

Absent: None

Also Present: City Attorney Huff; Interim City Manager LaFave; City Clerk Brower; Public Safety Director Herald; Parks & Recreation Director Bunn; Finance Director Mushong; Communications Specialist Licari (phone); Janyce Huff

2020-46. The agenda was approved as published.

2020-47. No public comment was received.

2020-48. Commissioner Walters thanked the staff members who set up the virtual meeting. He also thanked the Public Safety Department and the Public Works Department for continuing vital operations and maintaining critical infrastructure during the COVID-19 crisis.

Commissioner Hamrick agreed and thanked all those working in the medical field for their efforts to combat the virus and treat those affected by it.

Commissioner Arendshorst commended the community for coming together during this crisis by helping each other with shopping and meals and for taking all the precautions recommended by the experts.

Commissioner Pachla thanked Jan Huff and Karen Brower for their work setting up and administering the virtual meeting. He also thanked the essential staff members who are still working to make sure residents have the services and infrastructure they need.

Commissioner Hecksel commended all front-line health care and those in essential industries who are continuing to work to make sure people have medical services and needed products and services.

Commissioner Duncan thanked Interim City Manager LaFave for his frequent updates on the city's responses to the changing directives and asked everyone to do their part to follow guidelines for social distancing.

Interim City Manager LaFave noted the city continues to monitor and follow the guidelines provided by the Kent County Health Department, the Michigan Dept. of Health and the Center for Disease Control and will continue to provide updates and resources to the community.

Mayor Favale reiterated the thanks to all those working in health care facilities and critical industries. She thanked all citizens for following the guidelines for social distancing and personal hygiene.

2020-49. Hamrick-Duncan. To approve the consent agenda as follows:

2020-49-A. Minutes of the regular meeting held March 16, 2020.

2020-49-B. Payroll disbursements of \$223,259.30; county and school disbursements of \$-0-, and total remaining disbursements of \$739,398.54.

- 2020-49-C. Resolution establishing intent to complete the Michigan Economic Development Corporation's Redevelopment Ready Communities Certification as attached in Exhibit "A."
- 2020-49-D. Planning Commission 2019 annual report.
- 2020-49-E. Public Safety Department Annual Review of response to resistance incidents.
- 2020-49-F. The purchase of four automatic external defibrillators from Stryker Medical of Chicago, Illinois at a cost of \$9,532.80.
- 2020-49-G. Upgrades to the pedestrian signal crossings at Lakeside Drive and Wealthy Street under the contract with the City of Grand Rapids in the amount of \$7,000.00.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7
Nays: -0-

- 2020-50. Department Directors presented highlights from their Goals & Objectives plans and answered questions from the City Commission.

Interim City Manager LaFave explained the efforts to maintain a balanced budget, begin work on a mobility/bicycle action plan which will include public participation when appropriate, working with the finance department on several other financial goals, and beginning union negotiations for new contracts this year. City Clerk Brower noted there were two significant elections later this year and outlined plans to continue our communications strategies via the website, e-newsletter and social media.

Commissioner Walters asked that finalizing the city manager's position be added to the goals program for the year. He noted Mr. LaFave has done an outstanding job and looked forward to putting long-term plans in place. Interim City Manager LaFave stated he will work with the city commission on a plan and timeline for this item.

Finance Director Mushong outlined plans to further explore pension funding alternatives as well as implement new interactive features for the budget book. She stated the Finance Department is currently rotating staff between working in the office and working from home during the COVID-19 situation. While some functions like assessing's field inspections were on hold, she felt working at home could actually help with getting started on some of this year's goals as staff members could focus on projects without the distractions of the office.

Parks & Recreation Director Bunn reviewed the drainage improvements completed at Manhattan Park last year and outlined his department's plans to explore additional trails at Manhattan Park as well as updating other existing facilities. He noted the department is currently looking for ways to implement virtual classes and programs amid the COVID-19 closures and hopes to have some initial offerings soon.

Interim City Manager LaFave discussed the Public Works Department's plans to begin data collection and field work for the mobility plan project, continue the Redevelopment Ready Certification process, explore pedestrian safety improvements and oversee infrastructure improvements. The commission asked Mr. LaFave to change the goal for covered bike racks to covered bus stops in Gaslight Village, recognizing options may be limited due to available space and the priorities/resources of the Rapid as they are the final authority for each bus stop. Commissioner Duncan asked that rezoning Lovett to multi-family be discussed again in the future.

Public Safety Director Herald noted the department would again be concentrating on efforts to reduce crime, improve pedestrian safety awareness and hire additional officers. He also reported on the county-wide dispatching project and the possibility of using public works employees as additional staff during fire calls.

Mayor Favale opened the meeting for additional public comment. No public comment was received.

The meeting adjourned at 7:40 p.m., subject to the call of the Mayor until April 20, 2020.

Karen K. Brower, City Clerk

Attachments: A – Resolution regarding the MEDC Redevelopment Ready Certification.
Attachments listed above are available for inspection at the office of the City Clerk.

PROCEEDINGS OF THE CITY COMMISSION
CITY OF EAST GRAND RAPIDS

Regular Meeting Held April 20, 2020

Mayor Favale called the meeting to order at 6:05 p.m. in the City Commission Chambers at the East Grand Rapids Community Center and led the audience in the Pledge of Allegiance. She announced the meeting was being held mostly electronically as allowed by Executive Order 2020-48 in response to the COVID-19 crisis. She invited any citizen attending by computer or phone to ask questions or offer comments during the public comment times.

Present in Person: Mayor Favale

Present Virtually: Commissioners Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla and Walters

Absent: None

Also Present: City Attorney Huff; Interim City Manager LaFave; City Clerk Brower; Public Safety Director Herald; Parks & Recreation Director Bunn; Finance Director Mushong; Communications Specialist Licari (phone); Janyce Huff

2020-51. The agenda was approved as published.

2020-52. No public comment was received.

2020-53. Commissioner Walters acknowledged the emails received from residents regarding a proposed traffic circle on Argentina and noted the emails would be part of the discussion at the next meeting.

Commissioner Hecksel reminded everyone to practice recommended social distancing and handwashing procedures during the COVID-19 outbreak.

Commissioner Duncan thanked all of the city staff members who are working to maintain city operations and infrastructure during the stay at home order.

Interim City Manager LaFave thanked the commissioners and community members for supporting the city staff who are working to continue daily duties either onsite, in the field or from home.

Mayor Favale also thanked the city employees who are maintaining streets, answering phones, processing requests, patrolling streets and answering medical calls.

2020-54. Final Reading of an ordinance to amend Chapter 79C of Title VII of the City Code pertaining to recreational marijuana facilities and establishments.

Interim City Manager LaFave explained this ordinance amendment has been discussed in prior meetings because of the expiration date contained in the original ordinance. The proposed amendment contains the same language but removes the expiration date.

Mayor Favale opened this issue for public comment. No other public comment was received. Mayor Favale closed the public comment.

2020-54-A. Pachla-Hamrick. That an ordinance to amend Chapter 79C of Title VII of the City Code pertaining to recreational marijuana facilities and establishments be adopted as attached in Exhibit "A" and that staff be directed to place this issue on a work session agenda in June or July of 2021.

Commissioner Arendshorst noted that while he wanted to revisit this issue in the future, he felt that much of the data that would be needed to make any changes to the ordinance may not be available for some time. He felt it was best to hold a work session next year and then decide if any changes were needed.

Commissioner Pachla agreed that a work session would allow the public to give input and allow additional time for more information from the state.

Commissioner Hecksel stated he had originally favored a formal expiration date to make sure the issue was discussed; however he was comfortable with specifying that the issue be discussed at a work session next summer.

Commissioner Hamrick thought it was important to set a date to review new information and public input. She also wanted to hear from the school board and others in the community.

Commissioner Walters stated he would be voting against the motion because he did not feel that the federally mandated 1,000' buffer from school property or and the layout of Gaslight Village would change in the future that would warrant any changes. He noted that very little public input has been received, most likely because people are comfortable with the proposed ordinance that prohibits marijuana establishments in East Grand Rapids. He did not feel it was necessary to revisit this issue at a specific date in the future since any commissioner could ask for a review at any time if needed. He supported the ordinance amendment as written and did not feel a work session date was necessary.

Mayor Favale spoke in favor of adopting the ordinance amendment that removes the expiration date.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7
Nays: -0-

Commissioner Walters clarified that he decided to vote yes to support fellow commissioners who want to discuss this issue again in the future and to avoid the misconception that he did not support the provisions of the ordinance prohibiting marijuana facilities in East Grand Rapids.

2020-55. Introduction of an ordinance to amend Section 1.4 of Chapter 1 of Title I of the City Code adopting the recodified city code publication.

City Attorney Huff explained the city code book has been completely updated and is ready for formal adoption by the city commission. He recommended adopting this ordinance as an emergency in one reading to avoid any gaps in coverage or effective dates.

2020-55-A. Walters-Arendshorst. That an ordinance to amend Section 1.4 of Chapter 1 of Title I of the City Code adopting the recodified city code publication be adopted as attached in Exhibit "B."

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7
Nays: -0-

2020-56. Hamrick-Pachla. To approve the consent agenda as follows:

2020-56-A. Minutes of the rescheduled regular meeting held March 30, 2020.

2020-56-B. Payroll disbursements of \$214,182.17; county and school disbursements of \$125.34, and total remaining disbursements of \$694,229.50.

2020-56-C. The Public Safety Department's 2019 Annual Report.

2020-56-D. A four-year contract through 2024 with Cannonsburg Wood Products of Rockford, MI at a rate of \$10 per cubic yard for two 40-yard containers and \$5.00 per cubic yard for a 120-cubic yard trailer.

2020-56-E. The purchase of computer networking equipment from Eastern Data at a cost of \$14,930.00.

2020-56-F. The purchase of apparel and t-shirts for Parks & Recreation programs from Hillhouse of Grand Rapids in the amount of \$51,747.00.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7
Nays: -0-

- 2020-57. Mayor Favale reopened the meeting for public comment. No public comment was received.
- 2020-58. Finance Director Mushong explained the overall city budget is \$24.7 million in several different funds. She noted the city was transitioning to a new budget software that would be easier for everyone to understand and would be mobile friendly for residents to use.

Ms. Mushong announced the city staff is anticipating a significant reduction in state-shared revenues due to the drop in sales-tax revenue resulting from the COVID-19 closure of businesses. City departments will be deferring capital purchases until at least October 1 and will then determine whether the situation warrants further action or delays. Interim City Manager LaFave stated this “wait and see” approach allows the city to avoid reworking the budget until the impacts are fully known. Mr. LaFave noted the city policy of maintaining a 20% fund balance is to allow operations to continue in case of natural disasters or financial emergencies, so the COVID-19 pandemic would certainly be a case where utilizing the saved fund balance would be appropriate, if that becomes necessary. Commissioner Walters questioned whether the city would need to reduce staff due to the lower revenues associated with the COVID-19 situation. Mr. LaFave stated these decisions would be made later once the full extent of the financial impact is known.

Finance Director Mushong explained a new line item showing a 2% contingency for funds that will be used to maintain the recommended fund balance while allowing for fluctuations in various line items throughout the year. She also reviewed the trends in taxable values vs. assessed values, millage rates, and the impacts of Proposal A and Headlee amendments on local revenues. She noted that staff is still working on long-term solutions to the pension funding situation. She did not feel that any water/sewer rate adjustments were necessary at this time and highlighted the increase in street condition ratings following the first few years of the Street & Sidewalk Millage.

Budget work sessions will take place following the May 4 and May 18 City Commission meetings to review capital requests and departmental budgets before adopting a final budget in early June.

The meeting adjourned at 7:28 p.m., subject to the call of the Mayor until May 4, 2020.

Karen K. Brower, City Clerk

Attachments: A – Ordinance amendment to Chapter 79C pertaining to recreational marijuana.
B – Ordinance amendment to Section 1.4 of Chapter 1 adopting the new city code.

Attachments listed above are available for inspection at the office of the City Clerk.

PROCEEDINGS OF THE CITY COMMISSION
CITY OF EAST GRAND RAPIDS

Regular Meeting Held May 4, 2020

Mayor Favale called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m. in the City Commission Chambers at the East Grand Rapids Community Center and led the audience in the Pledge of Allegiance. She announced the meeting was being held mostly electronically as allowed by Executive Order 2020-48 in response to the COVID-19 crisis. She invited any citizen attending by computer or phone to ask questions or offer comments during the public comment times.

Present in Person: Mayor Favale, Commissioner Hamrick

Present Virtually: Commissioners Arendshorst, Hecksel, Pachla and Walters

Absent: Commissioner Duncan

Also Present: City Attorney Huff; Interim City Manager LaFave; City Clerk Brower; Public Safety Director Herald; Parks & Recreation Director Bunn; Finance Director Mushong; Communications Specialist Licari (phone); Janyce Huff

2020-59. The agenda was approved as published.

2020-60. No public comment was received.

2020-61. Commissioner Hamrick thanked the city employees for all their work maintaining services, infrastructure, policing and communications during the COVID-19 pandemic.

Commissioner Walters recognized City Clerk Brower and City Attorney Huff for their work in completing the recodification project.

Commissioner Arendshorst thanked the community members for being so involved in open houses, volunteer efforts and assisting local businesses.

Commissioner Pachla thanked everyone for following the social distancing guidelines in use right now.

Mayor Favale reiterated thanks to staff for all the services being provided to residents and communicating the changes, closures and resources associated with the COVID-19 crisis.

2020-62. Discussion of neighborhood mini-traffic circle for the intersection of Elmwood/Woodlawn.

Interim City Manager LaFave explained the proposal to place a small traffic circle within the existing intersection to slow speeds and eliminate non-compliance with the stop signs at this three-way intersection. He stated that a mini traffic circle at this location was an economical solution to repeated complaints from neighbors since Elmwood was scheduled for repaving this summer. Mr. LaFave reviewed the citation history and planned landscaping. Traffic Consultant Chris Zull and Professional Engineer Jarid Halverson answered questions from the commissioners on speeds, crosswalks and signage.

Commissioner Hecksel questioned whether the circles were designed to address traffic backups or to control behavior. Mr. Zull stated the circles would keep traffic moving through this intersection at slower speeds and provide additional safety because people would not be ignoring a stop sign.

Mr. Hecksel questioned whether increased patrols and enforcement would result in lower speeds for less expense. Interim City Manager LaFave stated that enforcement was a temporary solution, but a properly engineered circle will provide a 24/7 reminder to vehicles to slow down and pay attention. Mr. LaFave further noted that following the installation of a larger traffic circle at Alexander and Rosewood last year, there have been no further complaints from neighbors about speeding or infractions.

Mayor Favale opened a public hearing. No public comment was received. Mayor Favale closed the public hearing.

- 2020-62-A. Walters-Hamrick. To approve the design and installation of the mini-traffic circle at the intersection of Elmwood/Woodlawn for the 2020 construction season.

Commissioner Walters noted that residents in the area were largely supportive of this proposal. He felt it would be a positive addition to this intersection.

Commissioner Arendshorst agreed this was a cost-effective solution to make the intersection safer and to slow traffic.

Commissioner Hamrick stated the data shows this to be a good solution that will benefit the area. She noted that landscaping will be important to make sure the traffic circle does not detract from the nice neighborhood.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 6
Nays: -0-

- 2020-63. Discussion of neighborhood mini-traffic circles for the intersections of Argentina/Pinecrest and Argentina/San Lucia.

Interim City Manager LaFave explained that two mini traffic circles are proposed on Argentina Drive between Breton and Plymouth. One circle would be located at Argentina/Pinecrest and the other at Argentina/San Lucia, dividing the corridor into three roughly equal segments to slow traffic and improve safety at these two intersections. He stated that speeding and stop sign compliance have generated multiple resident complaints over the last several years and speed studies show the 85th percentile speed at 31 mph, a borderline condition for traffic calming measures. Traffic Consultant Zull stated that stop signs are specifically prohibited from being used to control speeds. He noted that misplaced signs often result in driver's disobeying the signs and increased speeds mid-block between the signs. He further noted that while there may be some initial confusion or occasional accident where someone hits the traffic circle, these decrease over time or cause less severe problems than the unwarranted stop signs.

Mr. Halverson reported the crosswalks would be in the same positions with only one minor change. He noted it would add expense to move the crosswalks farther from the intersections. Mr. Zull agreed and noted that the traffic circles should be safer for cyclists as well because of slower speeds and all-yield conditions. He stated that traffic circles greatly reduce the number of conflict points between vehicles and eliminate head-on collisions within the intersections.

Interim City Manager LaFave recapped that there have been few accidents in this area, but that the traffic studies show the speeds are a concern that should be addressed. Since this street needs to be resurfaced due to pavement conditions, installing these small traffic circles within the existing intersections is a cost-effective way to address the speeding and stop-sign compliance. The traffic circles will not remove any on-street parking or require any additional streetlights.

Mayor Favale opened a public hearing. The following people expressed their opinions:

- | | |
|--------------------------------------|--|
| - Pricilla Frakie, 946 Santa Barbara | Questioned the need for traffic circles and added expense. |
| - Brian Woodruff, 1011 San Lucia | Observed 20 cars roll through stop signs recently. Felt traffic circles would keep traffic moving safely while reducing noise and air pollution. |
| - Mike McDonald, 2150 Argentina | Liked the current stop signs for controlling traffic so near the high school. Stated all neighbors are opposed to traffic circles. |
| - Paul Kratochwill, 2011 Argentina | Agreed speed is a problem, but stated there is no evidence that traffic circles will slow traffic. |

No other public comment was received at the meeting. Mayor Favale closed the public hearing.

2020-63-A. Pachla-Hamrick. To approve the design and installation of the mini-traffic circle at the intersections of Argentina/San Lucia and Argentina/Pinecrest for the 2020 construction season.

Commissioner Pachla supported the placement of the traffic circles because the data shows that speeds are a concern and traffic circles will be a permanent deterrent rather than periodic enforcement. He also noted that traffic experts felt the traffic circles would reduce speeds and increase safety. He further noted that while a majority of those who had responded were opposed to the traffic circles, there were many more that did not turn in their comment cards and their feelings were not known.

Commissioner Hecksel concurred and noted that most residents are very concerned about speeds and pedestrian safety and the traffic circles are shown to reduce speeds.

Commissioner Walters agreed traffic circles could improve safety but would be voting against the proposal because the residents in the immediate vicinity are opposed. He did not feel that the speeding issues were enough to approve this proposal over the opposition of neighbors.

Commissioner Arendshorst supported the traffic circles from a practical and data aspect, but noted the opposition from residents in his ward made him hesitate to vote in favor.

Commissioner Hamrick spoke in favor of the traffic circles because of the staff and engineer recommendations and the opportunity to make a cost-effective improvement to traffic safety. She did not feel enforcement or speed bumps were good long-term solutions and felt traffic circles made the most sense to improve safety.

Mayor Favale noted that not all decisions are popular or unanimous, but the commission always listens to all input and weighs decisions carefully. She stated the resident complaints about speeding seem to be correct, but the stop signs were not solving the problem and speed bumps would likely not work either. She did not feel that property values would drop with the installation of traffic circles. She understood the neighbor's concerns but felt the speeding problem needed to be addressed and traffic circles were a proven method to do this.

Commissioner Walters expressed frustration with having to solicit input and answer questions by mailings and a virtual open house and wished there were more opportunities to meet with residents. Interim City Manager LaFave agreed it was unfortunate that the COVID-19 situation prevented in-person meetings, but explained that he had personally spoken with any resident who had called or emailed to ask questions or give input.

Yeas: Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla and Favale – 4

Nays: Arendshorst and Walters – 2

2020-64. Hamrick-Walters. To approve the consent agenda as follows:

2020-64-A. Minutes of the regular meeting held April 20, 2020.

2020-64-B. Payroll disbursements of \$192,701.88; county and school disbursements of \$-0-, and total remaining disbursements of \$430,781.71.

2020-64-C. The Public Safety Department's quarterly report for the period ending March 31, 2020.

2020-64-D. The purchase of two thermal imaging camera from Phoenix Safety Outfitters of Upper Arlington, Ohio in the amount of \$6,861.72.

2020-64-E. Resolution amending the FY 2019-20 budget for the quarter ending March 31, 2020 as attached in Exhibit "A."

2020-64-F. Updates to the Street & Sidewalk Funding Policy to account for the expected decrease in revenue received from the State of Michigan.

2020-64-G. The replacement of four vehicles through MiDeal contracts as outlined by the Acting City Manager and reviewed by the Finance Committee.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 6

Nays: -0-

- 2020-65. Mayor Favale reopened the meeting for public comment. No public comment was received.
- 2020-66. Interim City Manager LaFave opened the capital improvement work session by reviewing the budget submittal and review process. He noted there was approximately \$600,000 in deferred capital items that have not been funded in recent years due to budget constraints and that further discussions would be needed soon on how to address these needs. He noted further funding decreases were likely in the next fiscal year due to lower than anticipated state-shared revenues because of the COVID-19 situation. He recommended moving forward with the review and approval process for budgeted items with the understanding that all capital requests/purchases would be held for at least the first 90 days of the fiscal year to gauge the financial impacts of the stay at home orders.

Finance Director Mushong outlined her department's requests for various technology programs and upgrades.

Public Safety Director Herald explained requests for new and replacement firefighting equipment, mobile computers and software. He stated the department was withdrawing the \$45,000 request for body cameras because the in-car camera system was sufficient for use in reviewing officer interactions and handling complaints.

Parks & Recreation Director Bunn reviewed requests for new signage for the Reeds Lake Trail and Manhattan Park. He reported a volunteer group is working to raise funds for additional trail projects at Manhattan Park. Mr. Bunn and Mr. LaFave explained the request to fund the wetland mitigation obligation that has been in place since 2009 when a trail project removed a small portion of wetlands. They recommended fulfilling the obligation with a payment to an organization that funds wetlands projects. While the wetland project would likely not happen in East Grand Rapids, it would fulfill the obligation somewhere locally and would allow the city to seek additional grants from the state in the future without this lingering obligation.

Interim City Manager LaFave outlined proposed maintenance projects at the Community Center, DPW garage pool facilities and park buildings. He reviewed the various roads scheduled for improvements, traffic signal upgrades, additional parking ideas and water/sewer infrastructure projects and answered questions.

The meeting adjourned at 9:15 p.m., subject to the call of the Mayor until May 18, 2020.

Karen K. Brower, City Clerk

Attachments: A – Resolution adopting budget amendments.

Attachments listed above are available for inspection at the office of the City Clerk.

PROCEEDINGS OF THE CITY COMMISSION
CITY OF EAST GRAND RAPIDS

Regular Meeting Held May 18, 2020

Mayor Favale called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m. in the City Commission Chambers at the East Grand Rapids Community Center and led the audience in the Pledge of Allegiance. She announced the meeting was being held mostly electronically as allowed by Executive Order 2020-75 in response to the COVID-19 crisis. She invited any citizen attending by computer or phone to ask questions or offer comments during the public comment times.

Present in Person: Mayor Favale

Present Virtually: Commissioners Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla and Walters

Absent: None

Also Present: City Attorney Huff; Interim City Manager LaFave; City Clerk Brower; Public Safety Director Herald; Parks & Recreation Director Bunn; Finance Director Mushong; Communications Specialist Licari (phone); Janyce Huff; Arborist Mueller

2020-67. The agenda was approved as published.

2020-68. David Distel, 960 San Lucia, requested reconsideration of the decision to add mini traffic circles on Argentina because the neighbors felt the circles were dangerous, would be detrimental to property values and privacy. Felt residents were not given enough notice, representation, or consideration. Cited various sources of information disputing traffic circle effectiveness and anecdotal experiences of the neighborhood and driving other circles. He noted that most traffic slowed down for stop signs, even if they didn't stop, and he felt this was safer than traffic circles.

Carol Distel, 960 San Lucia, felt yield signs in traffic circles were confusing and stop signs were better. Stated speeds in a traffic circle would be significantly higher than the rolling stops happening now and someone would be killed. Asked for reconsideration as two separate agenda items.

David Ziegler, 944 San Lucia, asked commission to reconsider because things should not be approved during a pandemic. Asked for time to research traffic circles and get used to the idea. There have been no accidents or citations so this is not a danger. Reported pileups in Heritage Hill neighborhoods due to traffic circles.

Jean Hopkins, 959 San Lucia, stated she has never seen an accident and agrees with neighbors.

Jim Mantakounis, 1901 Argentina, noted that while speeds may be high, he has never seen an accident and area is safe. Asked for an environmental impact study.

Lisa Nargi, 963 Pinecrest. Stated studies show no significant problems, so this should be reconsidered.

Bryan Posthumus, candidate for state representative, introduced himself and expressed interest in the issues in East Grand Rapids.

2020-69. Hamrick-Walters. Motion to reconsider the decision to place two mini traffic circles on Argentina Drive at the June 1, 2020 meeting.

Commissioner Hamrick wanted to have an opportunity to look at the sources cited by the residents.

Commissioner Walters clarified the motion would be discussed on June 1, 2020.

Interim City Manager LaFave stated that a delay until after June 1 would not affect the construction schedule.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7

Nays: -0-

- 2020-70. Commissioner Arendshorst stated he was very impressed with the neighbors who work so hard to make their voices are heard during this unusual time.

Commissioner Walters reported all the commissioners had attended the school board meeting last week and asked all residents to become informed about school funding matters and talk with their legislators in Lansing.

Commissioner Hamrick invited everyone to attend the virtual presentation on school financing hosted by the EGR Public Schools on May 22 at 9 am.

Commissioner Hecksel also encouraged attendance at school meetings. He reminded everyone to check on your friends and neighbors during the stay at home orders.

Commissioner Pachla asked everyone to consider adopting a storm drain near their home to assist the Public Works Department in cleaning off the grates to keep debris out of the storm sewer system.

Mayor Favale announced Cub Scout Pack 3218 would be placing white ribbons on lampposts in Gaslight Village to honor front line workers. She also commended the middle school robotics team for producing personal protective equipment for use by those treating COVID-19 patients. She also thanked staff for all their daily work.

- 2020-71. Discussion of treatment options for gypsy moths.

Interim City Manager LaFave explained the expert's recommendations for further treatment of the gypsy moth infestation that appeared in 2019.

Lee Mueller of Davey Resources, noted that the aerial spraying done last year along with the natural diseases and bacteria have caused a significant reduction in the egg masses and early indicators of population. He felt the population would continue to decline with natural methods and the cold, wet spring weather.

Mayor Favale opened a public hearing. No public comment was received. Mayor Favale closed the public hearing.

Commissioner Walters questioned whether the tree bands were effective in further reducing the gypsy moth population. Mr. Mueller stated they can be helpful even in low impact outbreaks. He also recommended removing egg masses in the winter.

- 2020-71-A. Walters-Arendshorst. To accept the recommendation of the city's forestry consultant to rely on natural fungus and tree band barriers to control any remaining gypsy moth pockets for the next year without aerial spraying.

Commissioner Walters stated he was comfortable with the recommendation that aerial spraying was not necessary and noted the city would provide the tree bands as further control.

Commissioner Arendshorst also preferred to avoid aerial spraying whenever possible.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7

Nays: -0-

- 2020-72. Introduction of an ordinance to amend Section 1.151 of Chapter 4 of Title I of the City Code pertaining to the Library Commission.

City Attorney Huff explained that staggering the terms of office would add continuity and allow normal business to continue even if there was a delay in the normal reappointment process.

2020-72-A. Duncan-Pachla. That an ordinance to amend Section 1.151 of Chapter 4 of Title I of the City Code pertaining to the Library Commission be introduced as attached in Exhibit "A."

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7
Nays: -0-

2020-73. Introduction of an ordinance to amend Section 3.130 of Chapter 35 of Title III of the City Code pertaining to the Parks & Recreation Commission.

2020-73-A. Duncan-Hamrick. That an ordinance to Section 3.130 of Chapter 35 of Title III of the City Code pertaining to the Parks & Recreation Commission be introduced as attached in Exhibit "B."

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7
Nays: -0-

2020-74. Hamrick-Pachla. To approve the consent agenda as follows:

2020-74-A. Minutes of the regular meeting held May 4, 2020.

2020-74-B. Payroll disbursements of \$192,701.88; county and school disbursements of \$-0-, and total remaining disbursements of \$430,781.71.

2020-74-C. An amendment to the street construction contracts adding Cardinal Drive as a mill/overlay project in FY 2019-20 within the approved budgeted amounts at an estimated cost of \$42,000.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7
Nays: -0-

2020-75. Mayor Favale reopened the meeting for public comment. No public comment was received.

2020-76. Interim City Manager LaFave reviewed the budget discussions held so far and noted that a public hearing and final adoption of the budget, millage rate and water/sewer rates was scheduled for June 1, 2020.

Finance Director Mushong explained the city usually spends 97-98% of budgeted expenses each year and noted a line item has been added to the budget summary to show the cushion between revenues and expenses. She noted that due to the potential decrease in state shared revenue due to the COVID-19 situation, city staff was recommending moving forward with the budget as prepared but to defer any major capital spending until at least October 1 to determine what effect the COVID-19 closures would have on revenues. Based on the current estimates from the state of a 6% reduction in 2020 and a 12% reduction in 2021, which would be less than \$200,000 total, she felt the city would be able to absorb these reductions either through the 2-3% of expenditures not used each year or with minor spending adjustments. She did not feel it was necessary to adjust the budgeted revenues and expenditures at this time and preferred to do this during the year as the effects are actually known. Mr. LaFave agreed that staff would be able to adjust to decreased revenues through deferring or eliminating capital expenses or other changes when the actual decreases are known rather than reacting to estimates that may change over time.

Finance Director Mushong reviewed the major changes in the Finance Department, including budgeted expenses for pension plan changes and allowing for additional election-related expenses in 2020.

Interim City Manager LaFave explained that several segments of the Public Works Department budget had been reworked this year to better allocate the charges for pension and health care expenses based on the job duties of personnel. He noted that fluctuations in the utility costs are often due to weather. The lake treatment budgets increases are based on the multi-year cycle of weed treatments.

Public Safety Director Herald reviewed the increased personnel costs due to added crossing guards and the return of the bike patrol program. He reviewed the budgeted overtime expenses and answered questions about how overtime is affected by new employees, retirements, vacations and other factors.

Parks & Recreation Director Bunn noted the department is waiting for guidance on how and when recreation programming, sports schedules and special events can resume and will adjust budget expectations once programs are back in session. He stated that all capital projects will be held at least until October 1. Commissioner Walters asked for a summary of all pool revenues and expenses.

The commission discussed how to best deal with the unknown stated-shared revenue situation and whether to amend the budget now or to wait and see if the projections are correct. Some favored updating the revenue projects and making a priority list for capital spending and other budget cuts that can be implemented later in the fiscal year. Commissioner Walters was not comfortable adopting the prepared budget without at least some type of language about deferred spending in the budget resolution so that staff did not go ahead and spend the funds without authorization. Mr. LaFave reminded everyone that any contracts and purchases over \$5,000 have to be approved by the city commission. Commissioner Arendshorst noted that this was a unique situation and that adjustments would need to be made to keep pace with the changing situation. Commissioner Walters wanted residents to be informed about the plans for adapting and staying within the budget. Mr. LaFave stated that new language would be added to the budget resolution noting the situation and the plans to defer spending.

The meeting adjourned at 8:57 p.m., subject to the call of the Mayor until June 1, 2020.

Karen K. Brower, City Clerk

Attachments: A – Ordinance Amendment to Section 1.151 of Chapter 4
 B – Ordinance Amendment to Section 3.130 of Chapter 35

Attachments listed above are available for inspection at the office of the City Clerk.

PROCEEDINGS OF THE CITY COMMISSION
CITY OF EAST GRAND RAPIDS

Regular Meeting Held June 1, 2020

Mayor Favale called the meeting to order at 6:02 p.m. in the City Commission Chambers at the East Grand Rapids Community Center and led the audience in the Pledge of Allegiance. She announced the meeting was being held mostly electronically as allowed by Executive Order 2020-75 in response to the COVID-19 crisis. She invited any citizen attending by computer or phone to ask questions or offer comments during the public comment times.

Present in Person: Commissioner Walters and Mayor Favale

Present Virtually: Commissioners Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel and Pachla

Absent: None

Also Present: City Attorney Huff; Interim City Manager LaFave; City Clerk Brower; Public Safety Director Herald; Finance Director Mushong; Communications Specialist Licari (phone); Janyce Huff; Traffic Consultant Zull, Engineer Halverson

2020-77. The agenda was approved as published.

2020-78. Bryan Posthumus, candidate for 73rd District Representative, offered to talk with any citizen interested.

2020-79. Mayor Favale spoke about the death of George Floyd in Minneapolis last week and the resulting racial unrest across the country. She encouraged every citizen to research and educate themselves on these issues and to have conversations with others about civil rights and unity. Each commissioner also spoke at length about this issue and asked that residents come together to eliminate the divisions within our country and promote change, diversity and inclusion.

Interim City Manager LaFave reported the Public Safety Department had been working with other law enforcement agencies in the area to share information and resources to ensure safety for all citizens.

2020-80. A public hearing was held pertaining to the General Fund budget and the property tax levy for Fiscal Year 2020-21. No public comment was received. Mayor Favale closed the public hearing.

Commissioner Walters explained the impact of the Headlee Amendment rollback provisions on the city's millage rate over the years to those in the audience.

2020-81. A public hearing was held on the special assessment roll of delinquent accounts for placement on the July 1, 2020 tax roll. No public comment was received. Mayor Favale closed the public hearing.

2020-81-A. Walters-Hamrick. That the special assessment roll of delinquent accounts totaling \$50,163.87 be certified and placed on the July 1, 2020 tax roll.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7

Nays: -0-

2020-82. Final Reading of an ordinance to amend Section 1.151 of Chapter 4 of Title I of the City Code pertaining to the Library Commission.

City Attorney Huff explained the amendments will add provisions for staggering the terms of the Library Commission and Parks & Recreation Commission.

2020-82-A. Pachla-Arendshorst. That an ordinance to amend Section 1.151 of Chapter 4 of Title I of the City Code pertaining to the Library Commission be adopted as attached in Exhibit "A."

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7
Nays: -0-

2020-83. Final Reading of an ordinance to amend Section 3.130 of Chapter 35 of Title III of the City Code pertaining to the Parks & Recreation Commission.

2020-83-A. Hecksel-Arendshorst. That an ordinance to Section 3.130 of Chapter 35 of Title III of the City Code pertaining to the Parks & Recreation Commission be adopted as attached in Exhibit "B."

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7
Nays: -0-

2020-84. Discussion of neighborhood mini-traffic circles for the intersections of Argentina/San Lucia and Argentina/Pinecrest.

Interim City Manager LaFave explained the city commission had voted to reconsider the May 4, 2020 decision to approve mini neighborhood traffic circles at the intersections of Argentina/San Lucia and at Argentina/Pinecrest. He reported the traffic consultant and civil engineer had reviewed the websites and manuals cited by residents at the May 18 meeting and addressed those questions and concerns in the agenda materials.

City Attorney Huff noted that the motion to reconsider puts the original motion to approve the traffic circles back on the table as if it had not been voted on. The commission can continue discussion and public comment and then vote on the original motion.

Commissioner Pachla questioned whether a traffic circle would increase speeds on Pinecrest since the vehicles would no longer have to stop at Argentina. Traffic Consultant Zull stated traffic circle were designed to create a more uniform flow and speed from all directions.

Commissioner Walters asked for a review of the questions and concerns raised at the last meeting. Mr. Zull explained 1) sight distance concerns from trees and landscaping can be addressed with trimming and/or signage 2) current traffic studies show four-way stops are not warranted at these intersections and traffic can be well controlled by traffic circles, and 3) traffic circles have a lower impact on traffic and are more appropriate for this type of situation than bumpouts or speed bumps. Mr. Zull addressed the videos of a vehicle navigating a traffic circle in Grand Rapids by saying the vehicle was travelling an appropriate speed and only needed a slight adjustment to navigate. He noted traffic circles were more effective on vehicles travelling at non-appropriate speeds. Interim City Manager LaFave added that the traffic circle in the video was about 12' in diameter and the proposed circles on Argentina would be 20' in diameter, which would require most vehicles to slow down further than the ones in the video. Mr. Zull also noted that the proposal used existing curb lines to be cost effective, so the roadway would not be narrowed leading to the traffic circles as you may see elsewhere—the goal is to slow speeds and address the failure to obey the stop signs. Mr. Halverson reiterated this is a good design for a residential area with low impact to homes and drivers while being very cost effective.

Commissioner Walters asked whether the traffic circle at Pinecrest would be more likely to be disregarded or misunderstood due to the number of high school students who park in the area on their way to school. Mr. Zull stated in his experience he has not seen one group of road users abuse a traffic circle more than others.

Commissioner Pachla asked about the impact if only one circle were placed at San Lucia without the second circle at Pinecrest. Mr. Zull stated the circles are most effective within a 250' radius, so they are most useful when used in series along a corridor. They are an industry best practice for traffic calming because they force people to pay more attention. Mr. Zull further stated the sources cited by residents at the last meeting actually used traffic circles as approved methods for controlling traffic.

Commissioner Walters asked what impact the traffic circles would have on speeds on Argentina. Mr. Zull stated traffic circles produce a more uniform speed along the length of a corridor instead of the rapid braking and acceleration seen with a series of stop signs that actually result in higher average speeds when people attempt to make up time.

Mayor Favale opened a public hearing. The following people were present to express their opinions:

- David Distel, 960 San Lucia
No study of children/pedestrians had been made to know the safety impacts. Felt stop signs were the most effective. Upset this issue was pushed through during pandemic without enough public input.
- David Ziegler, 944 San Lucia
Has pedestrian survey been done? Will city take care of trees? Will snowplows damage? How maintained? Sprinklers and safety paint cost money. Traffic doesn't need calming. Stop signs are better, even with the rolling stops. Feels their voices are being muted.
- Paul Kratochwill, 2011 Argentina
Data doesn't make sense. Doesn't feel this will work.
- Dan Mercier, 936 San Lucia
Doesn't see how this can be explained to kids. Too confusing.
- Ted Burba, 1955 Argentina
People don't react enough to yield signs, need stop signs.
- Margaret Bloemers, 1940 Argentina
Recent trends in traffic control increase convenience for pedestrians and bikes, not cars. Very busy area where pedestrians outnumber cars. Cannot explain this to kids.
- Mary Ann Sheline, 1908 Argentina
Never had issues at this corner. Pedestrians are more important. Issue more tickets for speeding and failing to stop.
- Jean Hopkins, 959 San Lucia
No accidents, current engineering is fine. Need a stop sign to make people obey.
- Joel Schultze, 933 Pinecrest
Has a teen driver who is very confused about traffic circles. Many more park here and won't be paying attention and will cause accidents.
- Dean Nargi, 963 Pinecrest
This is a solution looking for a problem. People must stop at stop signs; they won't obey yield and then it will be too late.
- Steve Rockwell, 840 Pinecrest
Used to be known that you didn't speed in EGR. Cops don't use radar anymore. Tickets down 85% since 2000. Enforce the laws we have, don't spend money for traffic circles.
- Rhett Williamson, 959 Pinecrest
Trying to solve a problem that doesn't exist. Everyone opposes. Fire trucks won't be able to get through circles.

The following communications were received at City Hall concerning this variance request:

- Shannon & Stuart Hunt, 947 San Jose
Oppose traffic circles.
- Lisa Nargi, 963 Pinecrest
Corner does not warrant traffic circles based on speed, accidents or neighbor feedback.
- David Ziegler, 944 San Lucia
More research needed. Traffic circles not recommended as traffic control in this application.
- Joe Aardema, 1064 San Lucia
Support traffic circles because cars don't stop at 4-way stops.
- Daniel McLaren, 1058 San Lucia
Traffic circles don't fit our community. No accidents in 5 years.
- Anne & Rhett Williamson, 959 Pinecrest
Oppose due to headlight glare in windows, speeds are within acceptable range, access by emergency vehicles.
- Jeannine Rizzo, 1047 San Lucia
Don't see the need because there isn't a problem and they are confusing.

- Roseanne Mack, 2025 Argentina Traffic is not an issue in this area; doesn't need fixing.
- David & Carol Distel, 960 San Lucia No problem that needs to be solved, cited MUTCD sections on restricted views and use of multi-way stop control, NACTO recommendations for uncontrolled intersections, speed/stopping distance charts, Safe Routes To School Guide recommendation against traffic circles at school crossing locations and the ineffectiveness of mini-roundabouts for reducing speeds.
- Jessica Huff, 1058 San Juan Supported roundabouts to manage traffic.
- Brian Miller, 1033 Floral In favor of traffic circles as data shows it will work, they are becoming more prevalent, and will benefit traffic and pedestrians in the area.

No other public comment was received. Mayor Favale closed the public hearing.

Commissioner Pachla did not feel it was appropriate to avoid improving the area just because nothing bad had happened yet. He noted the data shows 1 in 6 vehicles in going over 30 mph and the problem can be mitigated with traffic circles. He noted these intersections did not warrant existing stop signs, but he did not favor removing them without putting some other traffic control device in place. He stated he placed a high value on the expertise of traffic engineers and felt this solution would be good for the area. He further stated that many in the area support the proposed traffic circles and it would be a disservice to them to not look at the overall impact that could be achieved.

Commissioner Duncan stated she had looked at all the materials and was comfortable voting in favor of the traffic circles. She noted that we employ experts to give us appropriate recommendations. She felt drivers would learn how to navigate the circles so that they become an asset to the neighborhood.

Commissioner Hecksel noted safety is the first concern cited by everyone and the experts recommend traffic circles as safer than stop signs. He thanked Mr. Zull for all of his work on this issue and expressed his support for the traffic circles.

Commissioner Hamrick reported the city had a policy for landscaping and maintenance of medians and traffic circles and there would be no need for sprinklers or paint at this location. She stated that some residents were concerned about speeding and supported the need for traffic control. She supported the concept of traffic circles to reduce speeds and increase safety and felt the concerns raised by other residents had been answered. She supported the traffic circle proposal as a benefit to the city as a whole.

Commissioner Arendshorst stated he would again vote against the traffic circles because he felt residents should have a say in shaping their neighborhoods as they feel best. He respected the expertise and the recommendation for the traffic circles but would not support them over neighborhood opposition.

Commissioner Walters stated he would be voting against the traffic circles as he felt this was a hyper local issue and not a city-wide situation. He noted that staff had proposed the traffic circles after receiving complaints about speeding; however, he did not feel that 30 mph was high enough to warrant this solution, especially since many residents are opposed to any changes. Mr. Walters felt the process was backwards and broken because the residents came to the city with concerns about speed, but now we are ignoring other residents' feelings about the traffic circles. He felt the traffic circles would have unexpected consequences such as increased speed on Pincrest. He answered the resident's questions about tree maintenance, snowplows, traffic enforcement, etc. He concluded the current situation was not unsafe and no changes should be made.

Mayor Favale thanked everyone for the discussion and input. She stated she would vote in favor of the traffic circles because she wanted to be proactive and make improvements when they are presented instead of ignoring an issue just because there were no accidents yet. She acknowledged that this would not be popular with many neighbors but agreed with the recommendation that the traffic circles would improve traffic safety and reduce speeds to more acceptable levels. She felt the traffic calming effect would be best for the whole city.

Vote on reconsidered motion 2020-63-A.:

2020-63-A. Pachla-Hamrick. To approve the design and installation of the mini-traffic circle at the intersections of Argentina/San Lucia and Argentina/Pinecrest for the 2020 construction season.

Yeas: Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Favale – 5
Nays: Arendshorst, Walters – 2

2020-85. Pachla-Walters. To approve the consent agenda as follows:

2020-85-A. Minutes of the regular meeting held May 18, 2020.

2020-85-B. Payroll disbursements of \$206,316.28; county and school disbursements of \$-0-, and total remaining disbursements of \$288,506.30.

2020-85-C. Quarterly financial statements for the period ending March 31, 2020.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7
Nays: -0-

2020-86. Mayor Favale reopened the meeting for public comment. No public comment was received.

The meeting adjourned at 8:03 p.m., subject to the call of the Mayor until June 15, 2020.

Karen K. Brower, City Clerk

Attachments: A – Ordinance Amendment to Section 1.151 of Chapter 4
B – Ordinance Amendment to Section 3.130 of Chapter 35

Attachments listed above are available for inspection at the office of the City Clerk.

PROCEEDINGS OF THE CITY COMMISSION
CITY OF EAST GRAND RAPIDS

Special Meeting Held June 1, 2020

Mayor Favale called the meeting to order at 8:04 p.m. in the City Commission Chambers at the East Grand Rapids Community Center.

Present in Person: Commissioner Walters and Mayor Favale

Present Virtually: Commissioners Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel and Pachla

Absent: None

Also Present: City Attorney Huff; Interim City Manager LaFave; City Clerk Brower; Public Safety Director Herald; Finance Director Mushong; Janyce Huff

2020-87. Resolution adopting the FY 2020-21 budget and setting a millage rate for FY 2020-21.

Finance Director Mushong noted the millage rate would be set at 12.0322 which is the maximum allowed by the Headlee amendment. She stated language had been added to the resolution stating capital purchases would be delayed until October 1, 2020 due to the expectation of reduced revenues following the economic impacts of the COVID-19 pandemic.

2020-87-A. Walters-Hamrick. That a resolution adopting the FY 2020-21 budget and setting the millage rate for FY 2020-21 be adopted as attached in Exhibit "A."

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7

Nays: -0-

2020-88. Resolution adopting water and sewer rates for FY 2020-21.

2020-88-A. Hamrick-Duncan. That a resolution adopting water and sewer rates for FY 2020-21 be adopted as attached in Exhibit "B."

Interim City Manager LaFave reported some operational increases from the City of Grand Rapids had been absorbed by the current rates and not passed along to EGR customers. He also noted that approximately \$1 million is budgeted each year for water and sewer system maintenance and improvements, which will need to be re-evaluated in the future as the infrastructure continues aging.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7

Nays: -0-

The meeting adjourned at 8:11 p.m., subject to the call of the Mayor until June 15, 2020.

Karen K. Brower, City Clerk

Attachments: A – Budget adoption resolution

Attachments listed above are available for inspection at the office of the City Clerk.

PROCEEDINGS OF THE CITY COMMISSION
CITY OF EAST GRAND RAPIDS

Special Meeting Held June 10, 2020

Mayor Favale called the meeting to order at 4:09 p.m. in the City Commission Chambers at the East Grand Rapids Community Center.

Present in Person: Commissioners Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Mayor Favale

Absent: None

Also Present: City Attorney Huff; Interim City Manager LaFave; City Clerk Brower

2020-89. The agenda was approved as published.

2020-90. No public comment was received.

2020-91. Duncan-Pachla. Motion to enter into an executive session to discuss an attorney's opinion in accordance with Section 8(h) of the Open Meetings Act. A roll call vote was taken.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 6

Nays: -0-

Commissioner Hecksel arrived.

The meeting adjourned at 4:10 p.m., subject to the call of the Mayor until June 15, 2020.

Karen K. Brower, City Clerk

PROCEEDINGS OF THE CITY COMMISSION
CITY OF EAST GRAND RAPIDS

Regular Meeting Held June 15, 2020

Mayor Favale called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m. in the City Commission Chambers at the East Grand Rapids Community Center and led the audience in the Pledge of Allegiance. She announced the meeting was being held mostly electronically as allowed by Executive Order 2020-75 in response to the COVID-19 crisis. She invited any citizen attending by computer or phone to ask questions or offer comments during the public comment times.

Present in Person: Commissioners Hamrick, Pachla, Walters and Mayor Favale

Present Virtually: Commissioners Arendshorst, Duncan and Hecksel

Absent: None

Also Present: City Attorney Huff; Interim City Manager LaFave; City Clerk Brower; Public Safety Director Herald; Finance Director Mushong; Zoning Administrator Mizikar; Parks & Recreation Director Bunn; Communications Specialist Licari; Planning Consultant LeBlanc, PSO's Hollis, Lobbezoo and Wallace, Janyce Huff

2020-92. The agenda was modified to move the budget amendments to the regular agenda.

2020-93. No public comment was received.

2020-94. Commissioner Pachla thanked those who had worked to reopen city facilities to the public as now allowed by the Governor's plans.

Commissioners Walters, Hamrick and Duncan thanked Finance Director Mushong for her service to the city and wished her well in her new position with Grand Valley State University.

Commissioner Hecksel noted the Supreme Court's decision regarding LGBTQ protections and that June is Pride Month.

Commissioner Arendshorst wanted to find things that could be done to keep moving forward toward racial equity following the death of George Floyd in Minneapolis.

Interim City Manager LaFave reported the Public Safety Department would begin addressing law enforcement's role in racial equity at the next city commission meeting and at their quarterly public engagement session on July 23.

Mayor Favale thanked those who donated blood at the community center on May 29. She reported 52 units of blood were donated. She also thanked Finance Director Mushong for everything she has done for East Grand Rapids and noted she will be missed.

2020-95. A zoning variance hearing was held regarding the request of Spectrum Health Blodgett Hospital to allow overall lot coverage by buildings and structures of 48.9% instead of the 47.7% previously approved.

Planning Consultant LeBlanc explained Blodgett Hospital has demolished the old parking ramp and proposes to construct a new ramp with slightly different placement and dimensions than what was approved by the city in 2018. The proposed new ramp would require a variance to slightly increase building lot coverage and approval of a revised site plan for the new ramp, entrances and setbacks. The overall impervious surface calculation will be reduced because some parking spaces are shifted into the ramp and away from surface parking. Mr. LeBlanc noted the hospital is an approved special use in a residential zoning district. Residential zoning deals with individual homes on private lots and not with institutional use such as the hospital, so some of the language and requirements may not apply the same as they would with residential development projects. Mr. LeBlanc explained that past variances and site plans would be voided with the new approvals and the hospital would

have to come back to the city if they wish to alter the approved plans or make further additions to the hospital campus. He noted the revised proposal moved the south parking ramp farther away from the street and also increased the overall amount of greenspace and lot coverage on the site with the added level of parking and the deeper setbacks which allow more landscaping.

Commissioner Arendshorst asked whether conditions could be placed on the variance or site plan approval. City Attorney Huff stated conditions could be placed on the variance if they directly relate to the variance requested. He further stated broader conditions could be placed on the site plan approval regarding the amenities contained in the site plan.

Brian Brassler of Spectrum Health reported the hospital had worked with residents since the prior approval to find ways to improve various aspects of the project. While shuttles bringing workers from remote parking lots is working, the hospital sought a way to add additional parking onsite for workers and visitors to reduce the impact on neighboring streets and the need for shuttles. The new proposal is more expensive, but will add additional spaces while distancing the buildings from the neighbors and improving traffic flow. He stated he would not promise there would never be changes to the hospital campus, but stated they have no current plans for additional changes. He explained the hospital is working to reduce the smoking on the sidewalks with employee cessation plans and incentives and the changes to the parking structure could not be tied to the smoking issue. The hospital is working to shift some services off the Blodgett site, but the need for hospital services continues to increase, so the need for parking will not go away.

Rodney Vanderzand of Spectrum Health reviewed the proposed changes by showing before and after representations of each property line. The new structure will be longer on the Sherman side, but set farther back from the street and allowing for additional landscaping and sound reduction and eliminating the setback variances previously granted. Plymouth setbacks will also be increased, and the stair towers moved away from the corners to reduce the impact of the taller sections. The garage will use half-height walls and screens to reduce the headlights from shining outside the building and noise from moving vehicles. Mr. Vanderzand reviewed the changes to the ambulance traffic flow to eliminate the need for ambulances to back up. Lot coverage by buildings is increased from 47.7% to 48.9%, but overall impervious surface is reduced from 75.8% to 72.2% with the proposed changes.

Mayor Favale opened a public hearing. The following people were present to express their opinions:

- Todd Astrauskas, 435 Plymouth

Spectrum is required to provide bussing per 2008 approval; not all neighbors were invited to participate in discussions; north parking ramp was completed illegally because of pending litigation; traffic studies are outdated and bogus; Spectrum Health website in 2019 detailed plans for vertical expansion and his attorneys advise they wouldn't need city approval to build higher; Spectrum won't give the number of parking spaces in the new plan; his inside information says Spectrum wants to move rehab facility to this campus and those people aren't wanted here.

No other public comment was received. Mayor Favale closed the public hearing.

2020-95-A. Walters-Pachla. That the request of Spectrum Health Blodgett Hospital to allow overall lot coverage by buildings and structures of 48.9% instead of the 47.7% previously approved be approved as outlined in the Zoning Administrator memo contained in the agenda materials.

Commissioner Walters agreed with all of rationale presented in Mr. LeBlanc's review of the standards in the agenda materials. He favored keeping the residential zoning for the hospital site because it gave the city more control over the development on the site as opposed to a hospital or institutional zone use. He noted that the parking structure was at the end of its useful life and needed to be replaced. While the exact number of spaces could be debated, some type of structure would be needed to house the spaces. He felt the small increase in building lot coverage percentage was offset by the decrease in overall lot coverage which added greenspace and better setbacks.

Commissioner Pachla also noted that the old structure was 42 years old and it would be expected to need replacement eventually. He felt the ordinance conditions were met and he would support the variance request.

Commissioner Hamrick also supported the request as meeting the standards reviewed in Mr. LeBlanc's memo. Commissioners Hecksel and Duncan agreed.

Commissioner Arendshorst felt this new proposal was an improvement from the prior submittal and thanked Spectrum Health for the improvements to greenspace and setbacks.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7
Nays: -0-

2020-96. Spectrum Health Blodgett Hospital site plan amendment request.

Kevin Judd of Spectrum Health stated the hospital will likely be able to eliminate most of the shuttle traffic with the increase in onsite parking. He noted most staff members arrive for work before the peak school and commuting hours. Spectrum plans to install a parking management system to distribute employee, visitor and patient parking between the entrances and sections of the ramps to further spread out traffic to avoid congestion.

Tim Drews of Abonmarche reviewed several aspects of the traffic study, including peak time periods and projections for traffic congestion and delays when the ramp is completed. He felt the existing minor issues could be improved and future issues could be managed with allocation between entrances, signal timing adjustments and other traffic management features if needed.

Planning Consultant LeBlanc noted Spectrum could build the ramp according to the 2018 approvals if the city does not approve the proposed plan.

Mr. Drews addressed several questions from commissioners. He noted that while there would be more vehicles housed on site, they would be spread out over various times and multiple entrances and better controlled and distributed by the electronic management system being implemented by the hospital. He felt that overall conditions around the hospital would improve and wait times at intersections or driveways would decrease. He noted changes could be made later to improve problems if they are noted. Chris Zull, the City's traffic consultant, agreed that there would be ways to improve problem areas after implementation. Mr. Brassler stated the hospital was willing to work on any issues that remain after the project is complete.

Mr. Brassler outlined plans for screening headlights from spilling into neighboring properties. He also reiterated the hospital's commitment to reducing the number of smokers on the public sidewalks and incentive plans for employees to park onsite when the project is complete. The hospital is also working with its operations managers to create a system to address neighbor concerns during and after construction. It was noted the hospital is required to have 1,859 parking spaces for its size and uses, and this plan will bring available spaces to 1,448. The hospital will continue to utilize off site parking and shuttles to meet the remaining requirement.

Mayor Favale opened a public hearing on the site plan request. The following people were present to express their opinions:

- David Brown, 551 Plymouth

Requested the commission require better smoking management, parking permits for residents if problems persist, greater transparency from Spectrum regarding future plans and neighborhood issues, requiring traffic exiting the hospital to turn north on Plymouth, brown cloth/mesh noise control barriers, greater police presence and higher fines to solve traffic issues, more mature plantings after construction, and directing more traffic to Wealthy.

- Sean Tilton, 1842 Sherman

Concerned about additional traffic and the extra level of parking across from his house for next 40 years. Prefer shuttles to speeding cars.

- Todd Astrauskas, 435 Plymouth Objected to Spectrum using 1-day traffic study as they were required to do more. City needs to draw a line in the sand saying no more on this site. Approved of new ramp location but without the added level for more spaces.

The following communications were received at City Hall concerning site plan issues:

- Brown/VanDokkumburg/Osipoff Dec 2019 concerns about traffic study, intersection delays and use of spaces for non-hospital traffic.
- Robert Osipoff, 511 Plymouth Unresolved traffic concerns, smoking problems, ambulance use and worry about future vertical expansion
- Robert Osipoff, 511 Plymouth Review of unsatisfactory answers to traffic questions, height of the parking structure, traffic backups, request for updated traffic study
- Robbi Osipoff, 511 Plymouth Request for compensation to neighbors for damages, increased traffic. Neighbor viewpoint should matter more than hospital.
- Janet Chobanian, 535 Plymouth Requested no further expansion, payment of legal fees, redesign of ambulance bay, designated smoking area on campus and a parking permit system for residents
- Carla Klimp, 521 Plymouth Limit or close the Plymouth entrance.
- Sean & Hillary Tilton, 1842 Sherman Opposed to height and added parking spaces. Site will be overbuilt.

No other public comment was received. Mayor Favale closed the public hearing.

City Attorney Huff stated the hospital could not build additional levels on top of the ramp without approval by the city since it is a special use in a residential zone.

Commissioner Walters asked for answers to Mr. Brown's suggested requirements. Mr. Drews stated that requiring traffic to exit northbound on Plymouth was not necessary at the moment but could be researched later. Mr. LaBlanc noted the Planning Commission had discussed the growth of plantings and felt a five-year plan for mature screening was sufficient. Mayor Favale noted that parking permits could be discussed in the future if needed.

Commissioner Pachla asked the hospital to provide reports on the contacts from residents, the types of issues that arise and the hospitals resolutions for these issues as he felt this was important to make sure problems were being addressed.

2020-96-A. Walters-Arendshorst. That the site plan presented by Spectrum Health Blodgett Hospital for revisions to their campus at 1840 Wealthy be approved as outlined in the Zoning Administrator memo and blueprints contained in the agenda materials with the following conditions:

1. All previous conditions of the 2018 site plan approval still apply.
 - o Limit hours and days for construction, as noted in the letter (presentation) from Spectrum Health (7am-6pm weekdays, Saturdays as needed);
 - o Restrict routes for construction traffic to designated major streets (Wealthy Street, Plymouth Road, and Lake Drive);
 - o Require construction workers to park off-site;
 - o Require the applicant to provide the name and contact information of an individual to whom complaints can be directed during construction, as noted in the letter (presentation) from Spectrum Health (Tom Theoret, (616) 460-2793, BlodgettNeighbors@spectrumhealth.org);
 - o Require base-line foundation monitoring of adjacent homes to verify potential construction impacts, as noted in the letter (presentation) from Spectrum Health;
 - o Require that all comments in the City engineering consultant's review letter of April 19 be addressed;
 - o Require installation of gas lights and entry signage harmonious with the character of Gaslight Village, as was illustrated in the applicant's presentation;

- Monitor and maintain the landscaping to ensure healthy conditions; and
 - Require acoustical panels be installed on the back side of the Plymouth Street walls to mitigate the noise from ambulances.
2. Spectrum Health will submit quarterly reports to the city detailing resident engagements and concerns received during and after construction, including the name and address of the resident, the date received, the type of issue, and the remedy implemented. Those quarterly reports will be included in the City Commission agenda packets and otherwise be available to the public
 3. Spectrum Health will submit post-construction verification 6 months after occupancy regarding: (a) the resulting traffic impact relative to the Traffic Impact Study findings and operation at or above Level Of Service D under all conditions; and (b) the sufficiency of the available parking and whether it has resulted in a reduction in on-street parking in the surrounding neighborhood. If the Level of Service (LOS) for any intersection is below an LOS D, Spectrum Health will remedy the situation, with approval from the city, to bring the LOS back to a D or better.
 4. Parking spaces on the campus shall be used for Blodgett Hospital staff, patients, and visitors on this campus only. Spaces are not to be leased, sold, or used commercially for other uses without prior city commission approval.

Commissioner Walters reviewed the site plan standards for approval. While he felt the plan was better than 2018 with better setbacks and harmony with the surrounding neighborhood, he noted the added length on Sherman Street was a detriment. He was glad to see the detailed plans for traffic flow and parking management. He felt it was important for all parking spaces to be used for hospital purposes. He trusted the Planning Commission's conditions regarding screening and landscaping would be beneficial to the neighbors and thanked Spectrum Health for working to make improvements where possible.

Commissioner Pachla expressed concerns about the traffic volumes, smoking and added noise. He was encouraged that Spectrum was willing to work with neighbors to resolve these issues. He agreed the standards for approval were met with this project.

Commissioner Hamrick supported the quarterly report to keep the city informed about issues and resolutions. She also thanked Spectrum for increasing the setbacks and adding additional landscaping around the deck.

Commissioner Hecksel looked forward to working with Spectrum Health to resolve future issues and for working to improve the prior plans.

Mayor Favale agreed this design provided better buffering for the neighbors and fit better in the residential area.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7

Nays: -0-

2020-97. Public Safety Director Herald reviewed the two demonstrations in East Grand Rapids following the death of George Floyd in May. Both marches were peaceful with no injuries or damage. He proposed work sessions in the coming months to address some of the concerns raised by the demonstrators, community members and commissioners. The Public Safety Department has multiple policies and procedures in place and holds regular training sessions on the use of force. He agreed there were racial issues to solve in society and looked forward to having discussions with officials and residents about the operations of the Public Safety Department and any issues that need to be addressed.

2020-98. Budget amendments for the period ending June 30, 2020.

Interim City Manager LaFave reported staff had been working to predict the impact of the COVID-19 shut down orders on the recreation programming since all programs had to be cancelled from March through June. Staff reviewed the programs currently allowed to take place and what is anticipated through the end of the fiscal year and provided additional details on those individual programs. In addition, finance staff updated shared revenue projections from the State of Michigan for the overall budget forecast and prepared new estimates for the fourth quarter and into the first quarter of FY 2020-21. Beyond that, staff will continue to carefully monitor revenues and expenditures to maintain the desired fund balance and keep the budget balanced.

Parks & Recreation Director Bunn reviewed the impact of cancelling several large events and sports leagues that generate significant revenue for the city. His department will continue to monitor, develop new programs as allowed and budget carefully to minimize the financial impacts of the shutdown.

Commissioner Walters thanked Mr. Bunn and his staff for preparing the new forecasts and their readiness to adjust on an ongoing basis as more impacts are known. He asked that the commission be kept informed as things change so the commission can assist and make informed decisions.

Finance Director Mushong noted the city is in a very strong financial position and has been able to maintain its desired fund balance even during a 100-year pandemic.

2020-98-A. Walters-Hamrick. That a resolution approving budget amendments for the period ending June 30, 2020 as presented by staff on June 15 be adopted as attached in Exhibit "A."

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7
 Nays: -0-

2020-99. Walters-Pachla. To approve the consent agenda as follows:

2020-99-A. Minutes of the regular meeting held June 1, 2020.

2020-99-B. Minutes of the special meeting held June 1, 2020.

2020-99-C. Payroll disbursements of \$202,668.04; county and school disbursements of \$-0-, and total remaining disbursements of \$140,738.78.

2020-99-D. Appointments to advisory boards as follows:

Board of Review	Andrea Borden, 1445 Breton Merilee Fisher, 565 Lakeside Apt E Christopher Knappe, 2530 Maplewood	One-Year term ending 6/30/2021 Two-Year term ending 6/30/2022 Two-Year term ending 6/30/2022
Library Commission	Chad Balon, 2121 Burchard Betsy Brown, 1410 Sherwood Erik Daly, 1240 Breton Mary Dersch, 956 Lakeside Ryan Duffield, 735 San Jose Brian Hartigan, 630 Gladstone Deirdre Honner, 2011 Argentina	Three-year term ending 6/30/2023 One-Year term ending 6/30/2021 Two-Year term ending 6/30/2022 Two-Year term ending 6/30/2022 Three-year term ending 6/30/2023 Three-year term ending 6/30/2023 One-Year term ending 6/30/2021
Parks & Recreation Comm.	Nicholas Abraham, 1108 Lakeside Carol Campbell, 2109 Elmwood Kate DeVries, 1602 Mackinaw Lawrence Fisher, 565 Lakeside Apt E Elizabeth Mitchell, 1146 San Jose Adam Rogalski, 933Lakeside Aaron Smith, 1645 Laurel	Two-year term ending 6/30/2022 One-year term ending 6/30/2021 Three-year term ending 6/30/2023 Three-year term ending 6/30/2023 Two-year term ending 6/30/2022 One-year term ending 6/30/2021 Two-year term ending 6/30/2022
Planning Commission	Steve Achram, 1038 San Jose Matt Feyen, 630 Rosewood Greg Metz, 303 Briarwood	Three-year term ending 6/30/23 Three-year term ending 6/30/23 Three-year term ending 6/30/23

2020-99-E. The appointment of Deputy Treasurer Chris Berg as the Acting Treasurer, designating City Clerk Brower as the check signer and an engagement letter with Plante Moran for consulting services with a \$10,000 limit on consulting services unless additional services are approved by the city manager.

2020-99-F. The Joint Facilities budget for FY 2020-21 as recommended by the Joint Facilities Committee.

2020-99-G. A contract for winter maintenance road salt through the Kent County Road Commission at a unit cost of \$76.98 per ton up to the approved budgeted or amended budget amounts for FY 2020-21.

2020-99-H. Liability and property pool insurance renewals through the Michigan Municipal League at a total cost of \$166,324 for FY 2020-21.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7

Nays: -0-

2020-100. Mayor Favale reopened the meeting for public comment. No public comment was received.

The meeting adjourned at 9:18 p.m., subject to the call of the Mayor until July 6, 2020.

Karen K. Brower, City Clerk

Attachments: A – Resolution adopting budget amendments

Attachments listed above are available for inspection at the office of the City Clerk.

PROCEEDINGS OF THE CITY COMMISSION
CITY OF EAST GRAND RAPIDS

Special Meeting Held June 26, 2020

Mayor Favale called the meeting to order at 8:03 a.m. in the City Commission Chambers at the East Grand Rapids Community Center.

Present in Person: Mayor Favale

Present Virtually: Commissioners Arendshorst, Duncan Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla and Walters

Absent: None

Also Present: City Attorney Huff; Interim City Manager LaFave; City Clerk Brower

2020-101. The agenda was approved as published.

2020-102. No public comment was received.

2020-103. No commissioner reports were received.

2020-104. Duncan-Hamrick. Motion to enter into an executive session to discuss a collective bargaining agreement in accordance with Section 8(c) of the Open Meetings Act. A roll call vote was taken.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7

Nays: -0-

2020-105. The meeting recessed at 8:06 a.m. to conduct the executive session. The meeting resumed at 8:40 a.m.

2020-106. Approval of collective bargaining agreement with the AFSCME Local Public Works union.

2020-106-A. Arendshorst-Pachla. That a three-year contract with the AFSCME Local 1645 Public Works Union beginning July 1, 2020 be approved and to adopt non-union wages and retirement health savings programs as recommended by the City Manager program.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7

Nays: -0-

The meeting adjourned at 8:42 a.m., subject to the call of the Mayor until July 6, 2020.

Karen K. Brower, City Clerk

PROCEEDINGS OF THE CITY COMMISSION
CITY OF EAST GRAND RAPIDS

Regular Meeting Held July 6, 2020

Mayor Favale called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m. in the City Commission Chambers at the East Grand Rapids Community Center and led the audience in the Pledge of Allegiance. She announced the meeting was also being held electronically as allowed by Executive Order 2020-129 in response to the COVID-19 crisis. She invited any citizen attending by computer or phone to ask questions or offer comments during the public comment times.

Present in Person: Commissioners Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Walters and Mayor Favale

Present Virtually: Commissioners Hecksel and Pachla

Absent: None

Also Present: City Attorney Huff; Interim City Manager LaFave; Public Safety Director Herald; City Clerk Brower; Captain Buikema, Sgt Smith, Sgt Kolster, Sgt Schweitzer, Sgt Lindner, PSOs Wallace, Hollis, Lobezoo, Kreiner and Nagtzaam

2020-107. The agenda was approved as published.

2020-108. No public comment was received.

2020-109. Commissioner Pachla reminded everyone that state and local ordinances prohibit fireworks outside of certain dates around national holidays and fireworks are now illegal until Labor Day weekend.

Interim City Manager LaFave thanked staff members from the Parks & Recreation Department, Public Safety Department and Public Works Department for all the work on different aspects of the modified 4th of July parade that traveled nine miles through EGR neighborhoods this weekend.

Mayor Favale also thanked everyone involved in the planning and execution of the 4th of July parade. She noted she had received many positive comments about the effort to bring the parade to the neighborhoods where people could spread out.

2020-110. Request to approve a boundary line adjustment between 3188 Bonnell and 1114 Idema.

Zoning Administrator Mizikar explained the request to adjust the property line to provide a straighter line and additional rear yard space. He noted the new property line would not create any non-conformities and the resulting lots will still meet all zoning district requirements.

John Lowrey, 3188 Bonnell, showed photographs of the rear yard.

Mayor Favale opened a public hearing. No public comment was received. Mayor Favale closed the public hearing.

2020-110-A. Walters-Hamrick. That the request of Daniel & Susan Hayden of 1114 Idema to transfer 988 square feet from their property at 1114 Idema to property owned by John & Sandra Lowery of 3188 Bonnell Ave be approved, with the following conditions:

4. The split complies with the surveys and legal descriptions presented in the land division application, and
5. The relevant deed(s) or land contract(s) be recorded with the Kent County Registrar of Deeds within 90 days of approval.

Commissioner Duncan noted this was a very easy request to support as it made the lots more uniformly shaped.

Commissioner Walters stated the boundary line adjustment meets all the standards contained in the ordinance.

Commissioner Pachla also noted the request meets all the standards and thanked the applicants for working together on this request.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7
Nays: -0-

2020-111. Election of President for FY 2020-21.

2020-111-A. Hamrick-Arendshorst. That Commissioner Duncan be elected President of the East Grand Rapids City Commission to assume leadership duties in the absence of the Mayor for FY 2020-21.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7
Nays: -0-

2020-112. Duncan-Arendshorst. To approve the consent agenda as follows:

2020-112-A. Minutes of the special meeting held June 10, 2020.

2020-112-B. Minutes of the regular meeting held June 15, 2020.

2020-112-C. Minutes of the special meeting held June 26, 2020.

2020-112-D. Payroll disbursements of \$228,041.92; county and school disbursements of \$615,361.08, and total remaining disbursements of \$197,166.03.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7
Nays: -0-

2020-113. Public Safety Director Herald opened the work session by speaking about the strength found in diversity and the strides made by law enforcement over the years. He noted that most interactions between police and citizens are handled with professionalism and kindness, but that improvements can always be made. Mr. Herald stated that since 2003, there have been 17 race-based complaints made to the Public Safety Department. All were investigated, but no evidence of wrongdoing was found. He noted the Public Safety Department continually reviews policies and conducts continual training to keep up with any changes to laws and society norms.

Mr. Herald reviewed the department's "Response to Resistance" policies in depth, especially the *Tennessee v Garner* and *Graham v Connor* court decisions that establish national standards for officer use of force. Several officers present assisted with answering questions about the levels of interaction and provided a demonstration of a chokehold and alternatives that do not cut off air.

Commissioner Walters suggested the department consider ways to improve on the basic standards and levels of response and go above and beyond. Chief Herald felt this could be legally problematic and potentially confusing for officers during high stress situations. He did not feel it would be appropriate to go beyond the national legal standards set by the courts. Commissioner Walters reiterated his preference to continually review and improve the responses while listening to the community and learning from things happening nationally. Officers noted that split-second responses are often needed and having too many things to think about or additional/changing directives about can result in poor choices or injuries. Mr. Herald reminded everyone that a report was submitted to the commission each year detailing the responses to resistance by the department.

Chief Herald noted he was not opposed to working with some type of civilian board or committee if the members of the committee went through officer training and could be impartial when reviewing complaints.

Mr. Herald and other officers discussed the complexities of dealing with mental health issues, the need for continued training and future plans for coordinated resources to assist those who interact with the Public Safety Department.

Interim City Manager LaFave noted the department currently uses in-car video cameras to record interactions with citizens and has discussed the use of body cameras in the future. The in-car cameras are due for replacement in the next fiscal year, so the department will be replacing those units and then researching a compatible body camera system and policies to address privacy issues with medical calls.

Chief Herald offered to speak or meet with any citizen or official who have perceptions about racial profiling or bias in traffic stops or officer response. He noted that some demographic data is collected on reports, but that it is very difficult to analyze the data because of the different variables. He felt that open communication and dialogue were crucial to addressing perceptions. The officers asked for the commission's assistance in addressing stories or rumors when they hear them. Mayor Favale agreed that the commission needs to be willing to speak with residents and either combat misconceptions or pass along concerns that residents have.

Mr. Herald reviewed the "Campaign Zero 8 Can't Wait" policy proposals and how the EGR Public Safety Department addresses each of the suggested updates and changes.

Mayor Favale thanked all of the members of the Public Safety Department for the difficult situations that they handle every day and for all the work put into the presentation and demonstrations.

2020-114. Mayor Favale reopened the meeting for public comment. No public comment was received.

The meeting adjourned at 8:26 p.m., subject to the call of the Mayor until July 20, 2020.

Karen K. Brower, City Clerk

PROCEEDINGS OF THE CITY COMMISSION
CITY OF EAST GRAND RAPIDS

Regular Meeting Held July 20, 2020

Mayor Favale called the meeting to order at 6:01 p.m. in the City Commission Chambers at the East Grand Rapids Community Center and led the audience in the Pledge of Allegiance. She announced the meeting was also being held electronically as allowed by Executive Order 2020-129 in response to the COVID-19 crisis. She invited any citizen attending by computer or phone to ask questions or offer comments during the public comment times.

Present in Person: Commissioner Duncan and Mayor Favale

Present Virtually: Commissioners Arendshorst, Hecksel, Pachla and Walters

Absent: Commissioner Hamrick

Also Present: City Attorney Huff; Interim City Manager LaFave; Parks & Recreation Director Bunn; Zoning Administrator Mizikar; City Clerk Brower; Janyce Huff

2020-115. The agenda was approved as published.

2020-116. No public comment was received.

2020-117. Mayor Favale announced a community yard sale would be held at the middle school on Tuesday and Wednesday to raise funds for the school district's ONE EAST campaign. She reminded everyone about the blood drive on July 30 at the community center. Mayor Favale thanked Jan Huff for assisting with the virtual meeting platform since March. She announced that Parks & Recreation Director Fred Bunn would be retiring in January 2021 and thanked him for his 30 years of service to the city.

Commissioner Duncan asked all residents to consider assisting the school district with their current fundraising campaign. She also thanked Mr. Bunn for the many years working in the Parks & Recreation Department.

Commissioner Pachla commended the Public Safety Department for their quick response to a downed power line after the weekend storms.

Commissioner Walters expressed appreciation to Parks & Recreation Director Bunn for his years of leadership and improvements to parks and programming in the city.

Interim City Manager LaFave reminded everyone of the Public Safety community session on Thursday, July 23.

City Clerk Brower reported that absentee ballots for the August 4 election have surpassed record levels.

2020-118. A fence variance hearing was held regarding the request of Roger & LuAnne Bleiler of 443 Cambridge to allow the construction of 6' privacy fence along the Briarwood frontage of their property instead of the 48" see-through fence allowed.

Zoning Administrator Mizikar explained that since this is a through lot, both frontages are treated as front yards and fences must be 48" or lower and at least 50% opaque. The fence ordinance contains four standards for granting variances, including that there be a practical difficulty not existing generally in the city, that there will be no safety or clear vision concerns and that a variance should bring a non-conforming fence closer to conformity.

Interim City Manager LaFave reported snow removal on this street is challenging because the street is so narrow and there are fences lining one side of the street.

Roger & LuAnne Bleiler, owners of 443 Cambridge, explained they wished to install a 6' fence for privacy and safety of children in their back yard. Mrs. Bleiler stated if they did not receive a variance they would keep the old fence because they wanted the 6' height. Mr. Bleiler felt they could possibly install a new fence slightly farther from the right-of-way to allow snow to pile up outside the fence, but landscaping and the size of the yard would not make it feasible to move the fence more than a few feet. He also noted that safety is a slight concern when backing out of the driveway but the angled fence line allowed them to carefully back out.

Mayor Favale opened a public hearing. The following people were present to express their opinions:

- Ellen Schendel, 429 Briarwood Understood the desire for privacy, but opposed a tall, solid fence along the road due to safety and aesthetic concerns. Would support a lower fence or wrought iron to look better and allow sight distance.

The following communications were received at City Hall concerning this variance request:

- Mimi Ray, 417 Briarwood Opposed for safety and aesthetic concerns.
- Heidi Roine, 445 Briarwood Opposed due to safety.
- Ellen Schendel/Amorak Huey, 429 Briarwood Opposed for safety and aesthetic concerns.
- Doug & Joanie Dowling, 437 Briarwood Opposed for safety and aesthetic concerns.

No other public comment was received. Mayor Favale closed the public hearing.

Commissioner Arendshorst expressed concern about the look of a privacy fence along the street and hoped that a compromise could be found to provide a more open look on this side of the street.

Commissioner Duncan agreed that everyone was entitled to privacy in their back yard but felt that the entire street and neighborhood had to be considered.

Commissioner Pachla reviewed the standards for granting a variance. He accepted that the first two standards of uniqueness and difficulty were met, but did not feel the final three standards were met in this instance. He was concerned about safety when backing out of the driveway and snow buildup. He also felt a 6' privacy fence along the road was unattractive for the neighborhood in general. Mr. Pachla noted the intent of the ordinance is to promote openness and clear vision and the proposed fence would not meet this intent. He suggested giving the applicant time to explore other options for height and materials.

Commissioner Hecksel agreed there were other solutions for this fence and supported finding a compromise.

Commissioner Walters noted the standards requiring harmony with the surrounding environment and reducing non-conformity were not met and that the applicant had the option of replacing 25% of the existing fence each year without violating the ordinance. He felt there were better options than a new 6' privacy fence.

Mayor Favale stated she had ridden along in a snowplow down this street and it was very narrow and hard to navigate and the fences were problematic. She agreed that three of the five standards were not met with this proposal and felt there were better options.

2020-118-A. Pachla-Arendshorst. That the request of Roger & LuAnne Bleiler of 443 Cambridge to allow the construction of 6' privacy fence along the Briarwood frontage of their property be tabled to allow the applicant to consider revising the request.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 6
Nays: -0-

2020-119. Appointment of Finance Director/Treasurer.

Interim City Manager LaFave introduced Sharla Seath and recommended she be appointed as the new Finance Director/Treasurer.

2020-119-A. Duncan-Walters. That Sharla Seath be appointed as the Finance Director/Treasurer effective August 10, 2020.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 6
Nays: -0-

2020-120. Duncan-Pachla. To approve the consent agenda as follows:

2020-120-A. Minutes of the regular meeting held July 6, 2020.

2020-120-B. Payroll disbursements of \$223,163.51; county and school disbursements of \$2,242.22, and total remaining disbursements of \$150,098.67.

2020-120-C. A contract with Fer-Pal Construction USA LLC of Taylor, Michigan in the amount of \$468,167 for water main cured-in-place pipe rehabilitation and an overall project budget of \$560,000 for supply purchases, service line replacements and other costs.

2020-120-D. A contract with Kennedy Industries of Byron Center in the amount of \$280,686 for the rehabilitation of the Reeds Lake Boulevard and Greenwood sanitary sewer lift stations, and to approve engineering and project contingencies up to a total project cost of \$328,800.

2020-120-E. The purchase and installation of a new message display sign at the Community Center in the amount of \$13,655.00 from Legend Sign Company.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 6
Nays: -0-

2020-121. Mayor Favale reopened the meeting for public comment. No public comment was received.

The meeting adjourned at 7:04 p.m., subject to the call of the Mayor until August 3, 2020.

Karen K. Brower, City Clerk

PROCEEDINGS OF THE CITY COMMISSION
CITY OF EAST GRAND RAPIDS

Regular Meeting Held August 3, 2020

Mayor Favale called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m. in the City Commission Chambers at the East Grand Rapids Community Center and led the audience in the Pledge of Allegiance. She announced the meeting was also being held electronically as allowed by Executive Order 2020-154 in response to the COVID-19 crisis. She invited any citizen attending by computer or phone to ask questions or offer comments during the public comment times.

Present in Person: Commissioner Hamrick and Mayor Favale

Present Virtually: Commissioners Arendshorst, Duncan, Hecksel, Pachla and Walters

Absent: None

Also Present: Assistant City Attorney Roth; Interim City Manager LaFave; Parks & Recreation Director Bunn; Zoning Administrator Mizikar; City Clerk Brower

2020-122. The agenda was approved as published.

2020-123. No public comment was received.

2020-124. Commissioner Walters reported about 20 people attended the Public Safety Department's quarterly engagement session on July 23 to discuss racial bias. Mr. Walters also thanked the elections staff members for their work getting ready for the August 4 election under very unusual and sometimes difficult situations.

Commissioner Arendshorst noted there was a very good turnout in Collins Park last week for the mobility plan workshop. The next workshop will be held August 25.

Mayor Favale also thanked all the election workers who would be working at the precincts and counting absentee ballots tomorrow. She thanked everyone who participated in the blood drive last week.

2020-125. A zoning variance hearing was held regarding the request of Greg Clarkin of 1310 Woodcliff to allow a combined side yard setback of 20.4' instead of the required 21.2.'

Zoning Administrator Mizikar explained the applicants are requesting approval to the transfer of a strip of property to the lot next door to accommodate an existing driveway. The transfer will reduce the side yard setback on the property at 1310 Woodcliff such that a variance will be required because the combined side yard setback will no longer meet the minimum. He noted both lots are legal non-conforming lots and the required side yards are reduced by the same ratio as the lot size. Mr. Mizikar further noted that driveways can be placed at the property line with no setback requirements.

Greg Clarkin, 1310 Woodcliff, requested the lot line be moved to clear up the issue of his neighbor's driveway being located partially on his property.

Mayor Favale opened a public hearing. No other public comment was received. Mayor Favale closed the public hearing.

2020-96-B. Walters-Arendshorst. That the request of Greg Clarkin of 1310 Woodcliff to allow a combined side yard setback of 20.4' instead of the required 21.2' be approved as outlined in the Zoning Administrator memo contained in the agenda materials.

Commissioner Walters stated his inclination to vote in favor of the request, but was concerned that not all standards in the ordinance for approval were met, specifically that the circumstances are peculiar to this situation and not to others in the zoning district. Mayor Favale felt that having the driveway already in place for several years without anyone realizing the situation could be considered a special situation.

Commissioner Hamrick questioned how this type of situation could be prevented in the future. Interim City Manager LaFave noted these situations are rare and usually the result of an error in surveying when the driveway is installed by a contractor.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7
Nays: -0-

2020-126. Request to approve a boundary line adjustment between 1310 and 1318 Woodcliff Circle.

Zoning Administrator Mizikar reviewed the maps showing the area to be transferred. He noted both lots will be very close to the neighborhood average and no further additions to either home would be allowed without a variance approved prior to construction.

Mayor Favale opened a public hearing. No public comment was received. Mayor Favale closed the public hearing.

2020-126-A. Hamrick-Pachla. That the request of Greg and Linda Clarkin of 1310 Woodcliff and Ryan and Lauren Deleon of 1318 Woodcliff to transfer a strip of land approximately 2' x 92.9' from 1310 Woodcliff Drive to 1318 Woodcliff Drive be approved, with the following conditions:

6. The split complies with the surveys and legal descriptions presented in the land division application, and
7. The relevant deed(s) or land contract(s) be recorded with the Kent County Registrar of Deeds within 90 days of approval.

Commissioner Walters added that his support is based on the zoning administrator's report and explanations on this proposal.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7
Nays: -0-

2020-127. Contract for executive search for the city manager position.

Mayor Favale reported the Michigan Municipal League has submitted a proposal to perform another search to fill the city manager's position at a reduced cost since the position was not successfully filled with the last search. She recommended adding a second round of interviews and candidate assessments to the base cost of the proposal to insure everyone is comfortable with the process and the candidates.

Commissioner Walters thanked the MML for submitting the proposal and answering questions. He reiterated his desire to take the time to update the community brochure, to have an active outreach for candidates and to insure a diverse candidate pool. He also wanted to make sure that department heads were included in the interview process and discussion.

Jerry Richards from the MML noted the League has performed at least three searches since the beginning of the COVID-19 pandemic and has adapted their process to include virtual interviews when necessary. He felt there would not be a problem attracting qualified candidates for this position.

2020-127-A. Hamrick-Walters. That a contract with the Michigan Municipal League at a base cost of \$4,275 plus additional options and direct expenses be approved as outlined in the agenda materials.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7
Nays: -0-

2020-128. Hamrick-Pachla. To approve the consent agenda as follows:

2020-128-A. Minutes of the regular meeting held July 20, 2020.

2020-128-B. Payroll disbursements of \$224,086.52; county and school disbursements of \$2,719,995.78, and total remaining disbursements of \$593,017.74.

2020-128-C. Equipment purchases through the MiDeal purchasing program of an excavator with attachments at a cost not to exceed \$112,900 and an ice breaking attachment for sidewalk plowing at a cost not to exceed \$18,000.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7

Nays: -0-

2020-129. Mayor Favale reopened the meeting for public comment. No public comment was received.

The meeting adjourned at 6:47 p.m., subject to the call of the Mayor until August 17, 2020.

Karen K. Brower, City Clerk

PROCEEDINGS OF THE CITY COMMISSION
CITY OF EAST GRAND RAPIDS

Regular Meeting Held August 17, 2020

Mayor Favale called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m. in the City Commission Chambers at the East Grand Rapids Community Center and led the audience in the Pledge of Allegiance. She announced the meeting was also being held electronically as allowed by Executive Order 2020-154 in response to the COVID-19 crisis. She invited any citizen attending by computer or phone to ask questions or offer comments during the public comment times.

Present in Person: Commissioner Hamrick and Mayor Favale

Present Virtually: Commissioners Arendshorst, Hecksel, Pachla and Walters

Absent: Commissioner Duncan

Also Present: City Attorney Huff; Interim City Manager LaFave; Finance Director Seath; Zoning Administrator Mizikar; City Clerk Brower; Sgt Kolster; PSO Buter; PSO Coaker

2020-130. The agenda was approved as published.

2020-131. No public comment was received.

2020-132. Commissioner Pachla noted the traffic circle on Elmwood was being constructed and invited anyone interested in this type of traffic control device to walk by and take a look.

Mayor Favale welcomed Sharla Seath in her new position as Finance Director.

2020-133. Robert Stevenson of the Michigan Association of Chiefs of Police presented the Public Safety Department with a certificate and congratulated the department on the recent granting of accreditation from the Michigan Law Enforcement Accreditation program.

2020-134. Introduction of an ordinance to amend Section 8.9 of Chapter 8 of Title VIII of the City Code pertaining to drainage management requirements for residential construction.

Interim City Manager LaFave explained the proposed drainage plan requirements for residential construction projects to ensure good drainage practices are incorporated into new construction and to avoid problems after completion.

2020-134-A. Hamrick-Arendshorst. That an ordinance to amend Section 8.9 of Chapter 8 of Title VIII of the City Code pertaining to drainage management requirements for residential construction be introduced as attached in Exhibit "A."

Yeas: Arendshorst, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 6

Nays: -0-

2020-135. Approval of modified requirements for residential construction drainage management plans.

Mr. LaFave reviewed the detailed requirements and worksheet that will be used to implement the new drainage conditions contained in Section 8.9.

2020-135-A. Pachla-Hamrick. That modified drainage plan requirements for building permit submittals be approved as requested by the Public Works Department effective upon the final adoption of Section 8.9 in September.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 6

Nays: -0-

- 2020-136. Public Safety Director Herald presented the quarterly report for the period ending June 30, 2020. He noted implicit bias training was recently implemented for all staff and reviewed several statistical sections of the report where calls had increased or decreased. He reported the department is researching other data collection methods to enhance future reports. Chief Herald reminded residents to lock their vehicle and house doors to reduce crimes of opportunity.
- 2020-137. Pachla-Hamrick. To approve the consent agenda as follows:
- 2020-137-A. Minutes of the regular meeting held August 3, 2020.
- 2020-137-B. Payroll disbursements of \$226,234.28; county and school disbursements of \$3,609,059.86, and total remaining disbursements of \$139,964.23.
- 2020-137-C. Traffic signal and pedestrian signal upgrades at the Lake Drive and Plymouth intersection under the contract with the City of Grand Rapids not to exceed \$30,000.
- Yeas: Arendshorst, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 6
Nays: -0-
- 2020-138. Mayor Favale reopened the meeting for public comment. No public comment was received.
- 2020-139. Hecksel-Hamrick. Motion to enter into an executive session to discuss collective bargaining agreements in accordance with Section 8(c) of the Open Meetings Act. A roll call vote was taken.
- Yeas: Arendshorst, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 6
Nays: -0-
- 2020-140. The meeting adjourned at 6:45 pm to conduct the executive session. The meeting resumed at 7:37 pm.
- 2020-141. Approval of collective bargaining agreement with the Police Officers Labor Council.
- 2020-141-A. Arendshorst-Hamrick. That a three-year contract with the Police Officers Labor Council beginning July 1, 2020 be approved as recommended by the City Manager and that the education benefit provision for non-union staff be amended to match the AFSCME and POLC agreements.
- Commissioner Walters stated he would reluctantly support the union contract. He expressed serious concern about the contract provision to remove disciplinary records from personnel files after twelve months. He understood this was a common provision but did not feel this was a best practice, especially in light of recent events spotlighting police interaction with citizens. Mr. Walters felt disciplinary records should be kept throughout an officer's employment and asked that this clause be removed from future contracts.
- Yeas: Arendshorst, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 6
Nays: -0-

The meeting adjourned at 7:43 p.m., subject to the call of the Mayor until September 8, 2020.

Karen K. Brower, City Clerk

Attachments: A – Ordinance amendment to Section 8.9 of Chapter 80 pertaining to residential drainage requirements

Attachments listed above are available for inspection at the office of the City Clerk.

PROCEEDINGS OF THE CITY COMMISSION
CITY OF EAST GRAND RAPIDS

Regular Meeting Held September 8, 2020

Mayor Favale called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m. in the City Commission Chambers at the East Grand Rapids Community Center and led the audience in the Pledge of Allegiance. She announced the meeting was also being held electronically as allowed by Executive Order 2020-154 in response to the COVID-19 crisis. She invited any citizen attending by computer or phone to ask questions or offer comments during the public comment times.

Present in Person: Commissioners Duncan and Hamrick, Mayor Favale

Present Virtually: Commissioners Arendshorst, Hecksel, Pachla and Walters

Absent: None

Also Present: City Attorney Huff; Interim City Manager LaFave; Finance Director Seath; Zoning Administrator Mizikar; Public Safety Director Herald; City Clerk Brower

2020-142. The agenda was approved as published.

2020-143. Bill Saxton, 1637 Pontiac, spoke about his candidacy for state representative.

Kathleen Bruinsma, attorney, requested accommodation on behalf of her clients under the Americans with Disabilities Act and the Fair Housing Act regarding the installation of 5G antennas in East Grand Rapids.

Dawn Reed, 2946 Woodcliff Circle, asked the city to do more research on 5G antennas and to revise ordinances so these antennas are not allowed in East Grand Rapids.

2020-144. Commissioner Pachla welcomed students and faculty back to the new school year and reminded motorists to watch for kids walking to and from school.

Mayor Favale thanked the superintendent, school board, teachers and staff for working so hard to bring remote and in person learning to students this year in spite of the many challenges presented by COVID-19. She also commended the Parks & Recreation Department staff for continually monitoring the rules and regulations and working to implement classes and sports programs as allowed. Mayor Favale further thanked the staff members who have been working to provide information to residents who have questions and concerns about the 5G antenna installations taking place.

2020-145. Jennifer DeHaan of the Kent County Dispatch Authority provided an update on the consolidation of dispatching operations throughout Kent County and the installation of new towers and equipment to fully integrate all of the police and fire agencies.

2020-146. A zoning variance hearing was held regarding the request of Joe & Chari Mead of 2265 Englewood Drive to allow the installation of a swimming pool 6.5' from the property line instead of the required 10.0.'

Zoning Administrator Mizikar explained the proposal to install an 11'x25' inground pool in a small rear yard. He noted that lot coverage would still be within allowed limits and all other requirements were met.

Joe & Chari Mead, 2265 Englewood, explained the yard was surrounded by a 6' privacy fence and the pool was centered within the available space, meaning it would be located closer to the lot line than normally allowed. Mr. Mead noted the pool could be placed closer to the home, but that would mean a very narrow walkway between the home and the edge of the pool, which was not preferred.

Mayor Favale opened a public hearing. No public comment or communications were received. Mayor Favale closed the public hearing.

Commissioner Hamrick questioned whether the pool could be made smaller so that a variance would not be needed. Mr. Mead noted the pool was only 11'x25' and was already smaller than average.

- 2020-146-A. Walters-Pachla. That the request of Joe & Chari Mead of 2265 Englewood Drive to allow the installation of a swimming pool 6.5' from the property line instead of the required 10.0' be approved as outlined in the Zoning Administrator memo contained in the agenda materials.

Commissioner Walters reviewed each ordinance standard for granting this type of variance. He felt the situation was unique because the home's placement created a very small rear yard, which was created by the applicant.

Commissioner Arendshorst noted that while the proposal meets most of the criteria for granting a variance, not all lots are suitable for swimming pools due to setbacks and safety issues.

Commissioner Pachla expressed support for the variance. He agreed the standards were met except for the third standard which talks about the spirit and purpose of the limitations. He felt it would be too easy to ignore this standard and grant exceptions for any request.

Commissioner Hamrick agreed, but noted neighbors were not objecting to the placement of the pool.

Commissioner Duncan stated she could not support the request because of the dimensions of the pool in this already small back yard. She also noted there were options to place the pool without a variance.

Mayor Favale agreed the pool could be shifted and installed without a variance, but noted that the 3' shift would not make any difference to the surrounding neighbors, so she was inclined to support the request.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 6
Nays: Duncan – 1

- 2020-147. Final Reading of an ordinance to amend Section 8.9 of Chapter 8 of Title VIII of the City Code pertaining to drainage management requirements for residential construction.

Interim City Manager LaFave explained the new regulations will require drainage plans be submitted with the permit applications for construction projects on lots less than one acre. This will allow the city to address drainage concerns during the planning and permitting stage to avoid issues later. The new requirements will affect projects submitted after the ordinance becomes effective September 19, 2020.

- 2020-147-A. Duncan-Hamrick. That an ordinance to amend Section 8.9 of Chapter 8 of Title VIII of the City Code pertaining to drainage management requirements for residential construction be adopted as attached in Exhibit "A."

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7
Nays: -0-

- 2020-148. Duncan-Hamrick. To approve the consent agenda as follows:

- 2020-148-A. Minutes of the regular meeting held August 17, 2020.
2020-148-B. Payroll disbursements of \$220,096.50; county and school disbursements of \$16,838,684.37, and total remaining disbursements of \$795,103.51.
2020-148-C. Purchase of a six-inch water meter from Etna Supply of Grand Rapids not-to-exceed \$10,600.
2020-148-D. The sale of decommissioned equipment through biddergy.com of Kalamazoo at a cost of 5% of the sales from the equipment.
2020-148-E. Preliminary minutes of the Parks & Recreation Commission meeting held July 13, 2020.
2020-148-F. Preliminary minutes of the Parks & Recreation Commission meeting held August 10, 2020.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7
Nays: -0-

2020-149. Kathie Grinzinger, recruiter for the Michigan Municipal League, led a work session to discuss the search for a new city manager, including a proposed timeline for advertising, screening and interviews for the position and the draft community profile and candidate requirements that will accompany the advertisement. Commissioners gave their input on the brochure language and set the salary range for a new city manager.

2020-150. Mayor Favale reopened the meeting for public comment. No public comment was received.

The meeting adjourned at 8:43 p.m., subject to the call of the Mayor until September 21, 2020.

Karen K. Brower, City Clerk

Attachments: A – Ordinance amendment to Section 8.9 of Chapter 80 pertaining to residential drainage requirements

Attachments listed above are available for inspection at the office of the City Clerk.

PROCEEDINGS OF THE CITY COMMISSION
CITY OF EAST GRAND RAPIDS

Regular Meeting Held September 21, 2020

Mayor Favale called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m. in the City Commission Chambers at the East Grand Rapids Community Center and led the audience in the Pledge of Allegiance. She announced the meeting was also being held electronically as allowed by Executive Order 2020-154 in response to the COVID-19 crisis. She invited any citizen attending by computer or phone to ask questions or offer comments during the public comment times.

Present in Person: Commissioners Arendshorst, Hamrick, Mayor Favale

Present Virtually: Commissioners Duncan, Hecksel, Walters

Absent: Commissioner Pachla

Also Present: City Attorney Huff; Interim City Manager LaFave; Finance Director Seath; Zoning Administrator Mizikar; Public Safety Director Herald; City Clerk Brower; Detective Sergeant Kolster, Sergeant Lindner, Public Safety Officers Hollis, Gruzin, Hughes, Coaker, Pindner

2020-151. Approval of the Agenda.

2020-151-A. Arendshorst-Hamrick. Motion to add to the agenda an executive session to discuss a collective bargaining agreement in accordance with Section 8(c) of the Open Meetings Act, and to add discussion of a collective bargaining agreement with the EGR Public Safety Officers Association. A roll call vote was taken.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Walters and Favale – 6

Nays: -0-

The agenda was approved as modified above.

2020-152. Abbie Groff-Blaszek, 2360 Lake Drive, requested that racial data from traffic stops be released. She felt this would point the city in the right direction to eliminate racial disparity. She also requested adoption of the “8 Can’t Wait” campaign policies to reduce police violence.

Tina Murua, 1031 Lakeside, agreed with the request to release data. She has heard stories of people feeling discriminated against in East Grand Rapids.

Angie Walters, 1039 Pinecrest, also asked that racial data be released.

Bridgit Chin, Grand Rapids, supported the release of data to promote openness in dealings with the police and to begin conversations about the problems.

2020-153. Commissioner Arendshorst thanked the elections staff for all of the work preparing absentee ballots for mailing to residents. He commended PSO Kreiner and Sgt. Lindner for assisting a resident recently who was very appreciative of their efforts. Mr. Arendshorst also complimented Zoning Administrator Mizikar for working with residents to explain the zoning regulations and assist them with their projects.

Commissioner Hamrick urged residents to return their absentee ballots to city hall by mail or in person. She noted there was a drop box available 24-hours per day at the main entrance.

Commissioners Hecksel, Walters and Duncan thanked the citizens who made suggestions regarding the police statistical data issue.

Commissioner Walters commended the staff members who have worked to secure reimbursement for COVID-19 expenses through the CARES Act and other funding and thanked all the employees who have continued to provide services for the residents through the pandemic.

Interim City Manager LaFave reported on upcoming events and reminded everyone that leaf pickup begins the week of October 12.

2020-154. City Clerk Brower administered the oath of office for new Public Safety Officers Nichlas Pinder, Andrew Coaker and Austin Hughes.

2020-155. Public Safety Director Herald reviewed individual incidents and findings in the “2019 Annual Use of Force and Pursuits” report and answered questions from the commissioners. This report will be presented each year and reviewed with the commission.

2020-156. Contract for public wi-fi antennas through Kent County CARES Act Funding.

Interim City Manager LaFave explained that Kent County was using CARES Act Funding to install free Wi-Fi access antennas at public locations throughout the county, including Collins Park, Gaslight Village and Manhattan Park in East Grand Rapids. The city will be responsible for providing the monthly service costs for at least two years beginning in 2020.

Tim Mroz of The Right Place further explained the capacity and reach of the antennas and noted that installation will be approximately one month from approval. Specific locations will be chosen based on available electricity, mounting locations and natural features.

2020-156-A. Arendshorst-Hamrick. That a contract with Kent County for the installation of free public access wi-fi antennas in Gaslight Village, John Collins Park and Manhattan Park with funds provided by the CARES Act be approved.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Walters and Favale – 6
Nays: -0-

2020-157. Hamrick-Duncan. To approve the consent agenda as follows:

2020-157-A. Minutes of the regular meeting held September 8, 2020.

2020-157-B. Payroll disbursements of \$248,217.14; county and school disbursements of \$619,503.81, and total remaining disbursements of \$603,721.75.

2020-157-C. A contract with Corby Energy Services of Belleville Michigan for cured-in-place pipe to rehabilitate sanitary and storm sewer mains up to commission approved budget amounts.

2020-157-D. Preliminary minutes of the Joint Facilities Committee meeting held May 28, 2020.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Walters and Favale – 6
Nays: -0-

2020-158. Mayor Favale reopened the meeting for public comment. No public comment was received.

2020-159. Mary Ann Sabo from Sabo Public Relations led a work session on best practices for social media engagement with citizens. She gave tips on responding to questions and urged commissioners to always refer people back to the city website and staff members for further questions and follow up.

2020-160. Arendshorst-Hamrick. Motion to enter into an executive session to discuss a collective bargaining agreement in accordance with Section 8(c) of the Open Meetings Act. A roll call vote was taken.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Walters and Favale – 6
Nays: -0-

2020-161. The meeting recessed at 7:46 p.m. to conduct the executive session. The meeting reconvened at 8:09 p.m.

2020-162. Collective bargaining agreement with the EGR Public Safety Officers Association.

2020-162-A. Arendshorst-Duncan. To approve a settlement agreement with the EGR Public Safety Officers Association effective July 1, 2020 through June 30, 2023.

Commissioner Walters commended Interim City Manager LaFave for his work finalizing three union contracts this year. He stated he would be voting against the approval of this contract because he objected to the paragraph allowing expungement of disciplinary records after 12 months if there were no further infractions. He felt this provision was bad policy and did not foster transparency in providing information to citizens or future employers.

Commissioners Hecksel and Arendshorst agreed that this expungement provision should be removed in future contracts, but felt this was an issue for the future and could not be solved with the current contract.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel and Favale – 5
Nays: Walters – 1

The meeting adjourned at 8:14 p.m., subject to the call of the Mayor until September 21, 2020.

Karen K. Brower, City Clerk

PROCEEDINGS OF THE CITY COMMISSION
CITY OF EAST GRAND RAPIDS

Regular Meeting Held October 5, 2020

Mayor Favale called the meeting to order at 6:01 p.m. in the City Commission Chambers at the East Grand Rapids Community Center and led the audience in the Pledge of Allegiance. She announced the meeting was also being held electronically as allowed by Executive Order 2020-154 in response to the COVID-19 crisis. She invited any citizen attending by computer or phone to ask questions or offer comments during the public comment times.

Present in Person: Commissioner Hamrick and Mayor Favale

Present Virtually: Commissioners Arendshorst, Duncan, Hecksel, Pachla and Walters

Absent: None

Also Present: City Attorney Huff; Interim City Manager LaFave; Finance Director Seath; Zoning Administrator Mizikar; Public Safety Director Herald; City Clerk Brower

2020-163. The agenda was approved as distributed.

2020-164. Laura St. Louis of Disability Advocates introduced herself and her work for those with disabilities.

2020-165. Commissioner Hamrick urged everyone to return their absentee ballots for the Presidential election as soon as possible and to contact the city offices if there are any election questions.

Commissioner Hecksel noted that most ballots returned so far had used the city's secure drop box at the front entrance of the community center and further encouraged people to use the drop box to submit their ballots.

City Clerk Brower gave an update on the record number of absentee ballots issued for the upcoming election and the voter education efforts on registration and voting options.

2020-166. The quarterly report detailing communications between Blodgett Hospital and surrounding neighbors about the construction project was received by the commission.

Commissioner Walters asked that future reports include any staff comments in the cover memo. Commissioner Pachla requested that the current status of any items not yet resolved be included as well. Interim City Manager LaFave reported he was meeting with hospital officials soon about the smoking issue.

2020-167. Resolution and agreement to establish a Retirement Health Savings Program for city employees.

Interim City Manager LaFave explained the RHSP would be optional for current city employees with less than 10 years of service and that all new employees would be automatically enrolled in the plan. The implementation of the RHSP will allow more consistent budgeting and allow healthcare expenses to be paid from the RHSP instead of from the general fund.

2020-167-A. ~~Pachla-Arendshorst~~. That a resolution adopting a Retirement Health Savings Program for city employees and a contract with ICMA-RC for the implementation and administration of the program be adopted as attached in Exhibits "A" and "B."

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7

Nays: -0-

2020-168. Discussion of participation in the Municipal Employees' Retirement System.

Interim City Manager LaFave explained that the City had closed the defined benefit plan to new employees in 2001. City officials have not been satisfied with the performance of the investments and were now exploring the options for implementing a self-funded plan with assets managed by a contracted fiduciary company. There would be no changes to the payments or benefits for retirees or current employees enrolled in the plan.

Chris Veenstra of Watkins-Ross outlined the withdrawal process and the options and considerations for establishing a self-funded defined benefit plan. He explained the city's options for short-term and long-term funding and the flexibility gained by leaving the MERS system and implementing an independent pension plan to meet the city's needs. He noted the city would be responsible to hire professional companies to manage the investments, administer the plans and prepare actuarial valuations.

Mayor Favale thanked the staff members who have worked to explore the options presented tonight. She felt the future flexibility would greatly benefit the city and looked forward to discussing this further.

Mayor Favale opened the meeting for public comment on this issue. No public comment was received.

This issue will be discussed again at the meeting on October 19, 2020.

2020-169. Hamrick-Duncan. To approve the consent agenda as follows:

2020-169-A. Minutes of the regular meeting held September 21, 2020.

2020-169-B. Payroll disbursements of \$223,776.26; county and school disbursements of \$369,794.43, and total remaining disbursements of \$518,584.42.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7

Nays: -0-

2020-170. Mayor Favale reopened the meeting for public comment. No public comment was received.

The meeting adjourned at 7:01 p.m., subject to the call of the Mayor until October 19, 2020.

Karen K. Brower, City Clerk

Attachments: A – Resolution adopting a Retirement Health Savings Program for city employees
B – Contract with ICMA-RC for Retirement Health Savings Program

Attachments listed above are available for inspection at the office of the City Clerk.

PROCEEDINGS OF THE CITY COMMISSION
CITY OF EAST GRAND RAPIDS

Regular Meeting Held October 19, 2020

Mayor Favale called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m. in the City Commission Chambers at the East Grand Rapids Community Center and led the audience in the Pledge of Allegiance. She announced the meeting was also being held electronically as allowed by the recent amendment to the Michigan Open Meetings Act in response to the COVID-19 crisis. She invited any citizen attending by computer or phone to ask questions or offer comments during the public comment times.

Present in Person: Commissioners Duncan, Hamrick and Mayor Favale

Present Virtually: Commissioners Arendshorst, Hecksel, Pachla and Walters

Absent: None

Also Present: City Attorney Huff; Interim City Manager LaFave; Finance Director Seath; Zoning Administrator Mizikar; Public Safety Director Herald; Captain Buikema; City Clerk Brower

2020-171. The agenda was approved as distributed.

2020-172. No public comment was received.

2020-173. Commissioner Hamrick reminded everyone to return their absentee ballots to the city as soon as possible.

Commissioner Pachla reported voter registration continues at the city offices up until 8 pm on election day.

Commissioner Walters expressed appreciation for the amendments to the Open Meetings Act which allow the commission to vote virtually during the COVID-19 pandemic. He also noted that the school board is meeting at the same time as the city commission and asked the Mayor to try to avoid these conflicts in the future.

Commissioner Hecksel announced that two bike repair stands and a water bottle filling station have been installed recently thanks to grants from the East Grand Rapids Community Foundation. He also reminded everyone about the demonstration project on Lakeside Drive at Greenwood and urged everyone to take the survey found on the city's website about the proposed change.

Interim City Manager LaFave reported Public Works crews will be picking up leaves until December 11. He also noted the city has updated all its policies and procedures to reflect the latest orders and guidance for COVID-19 for employees and guests of city facilities.

City Clerk Brower provided an update on the upcoming election and reminded voters to plan ahead if returning their absentee ballot by mail so that the ballot arrives by election day.

Mayor Favale thanked everyone already signed up to participate in the next community blood drive. She also commended those who organized and attended the "Beet" Breast Cancer event at Clean Juice in Gaslight Village recently.

2020-174. Zoning variance hearing on the request of Patrick & Sonya Lincolnhol of 961 San Jose to allow the construction of an addition to the home creating a side yard setback of 3'11" instead of the required 7'0."

Zoning Administrator Mizikar explained the addition would connect the home to the existing detached garage, thereby requiring the garage to meet the same setback requirements as the principal structure. Mr. Mizikar noted an additional setback of 25' must be met from the western property line if an attached garage is rebuilt closer to the street.

Patrick Lincolnhol, 961 San Jose, explained the addition would add another bedroom and a family room to the home. The current garage was built in 1951 and they preferred to work around it rather than rebuild it in a less desirable location.

Commissioner Pachla expressed concern about granting such a significant variance when there were other options available, including consideration of lesser variances for the separation distance between the home and garage, a different reduced side yard or a smaller rear yard.

Mayor Favale opened a public hearing. The following communications were received at City Hall concerning this variance request:

- Paul & Roseanne Mack, 2025 Argentina No objections.

No other public comment was received. Mayor Favale closed the public hearing.

Commissioner Pachla noted the differences between attached and detached garages and felt that variances should not be granted to connect the structures unless there are special circumstances where zoning requirements cannot be met. He noted there were a lot of detached garages in East GR and he was concerned about the precedent that granting such significant variances from the normal requirements would set. He stated he would be willing to consider a lesser or different type of variance for this project.

Commissioner Walters did not feel that special circumstances applied as the lot was not significantly undersized and there seem to be other options available. He did not feel the actions of the applicants had caused the situation or that an addition would be a detriment to the neighbors. He agreed there were likely options for reducing the variance needed or building an addition without needing a variance. He suggested tabling the request to allow the applicant time to consider alternatives.

Commissioner Hecksel also felt this situation was not unique and he preferred not to set a precedent by granting such a significant variance. Commissioner Arendshorst agreed.

Commissioner Duncan understood the need for additional space but felt there were other options available that would require lesser variances or eliminate the need for a variance.

Commissioner Hamrick agreed Mr. Lincolnhol did not create the detached garage setback, but didn't feel the other standards are met for a variance.

Mayor Favale noted that while this was a great project, she did not feel the intent of the setback ordinance was to allow this type of connection. She further noted that a new home would not be allowed to be built with the proposed setback if the lot was vacant.

2020-175. Duncan-Hamrick. That the request of Patrick & Sonya Lincolnhol of 961 San Jose to allow the construction of an addition to the home creating a side yard setback of 3'11" instead of the required 7'0" be tabled to allow the applicant time to review their plans with their contractor.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7
Nays: -0-

2020-176. Resolution Terminating Participation in the Municipal Employees' Retirement System (MERS).

Interim City Manager LaFave explained the plan to leave MERS and establish an independent system with the same benefits to employees and retirees while providing fiscal stability for the city. Those receiving benefits from the plan will see no reduction in their benefit amounts, just from a different bank.

Julie Hamlet, consulting attorney, reported the transfer of assets would be completed by mid-February allowing plenty of time to work out details of the separation agreement and continuation of benefits for plan participants.

Commissioner Walters suggested finding a single vendor to provide administration, investment and actuarial services. Interim City Manager LaFave agreed this would be ideal, but that all options would be considered before contracts were issued.

Martin Donker, 8210 Meyers Lake, had no issues with MERS or new plan, just want to make sure benefits are secure.

No other public comment was received. Mayor Favale closed public comment.

2020-176-A. Walters-Arendshorst. That a resolution terminating the City of East Grand Rapids' participation in the defined benefit plan with the Michigan Employees' Retirement System (MERS) be adopted as attached in Exhibit "A."

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7

Nays: -0-

2020-177. Update on collection of racial data for Public Safety Department reports.

Interim City Manager LaFave explained that racial and gender data has not been consistently collected on traffic stop reports, so there is not a good sampling of data to determine whether there is any type of bias in police operations. An expert hired by the city noted some inconsistent policies and general discomfort by officers to determine race. The Public Safety Department is moving forward with several changes that will be implemented January 1 to begin consistently collecting the needed data to begin reporting results to the public.

Captain Buikema outlined the policy changes, software updates and training that have either already been completed or are in progress to allow the accurate collection of race and gender data. Officers will now be required to enter this data on reports in the field for all traffic stops and crash reports and are being trained on how to input this information. Mr. Buikema answered several questions from commissioners on the different types of traffic stops, how determinations are made, and the new training provided.

Commissioner Pachla questioned how the data will be analyzed once collected. Captain Buikema stated the city would likely contract with an expert to review and analyze data at first to help determine if any data collection changes need to be made, to advise on additional training needed or to determine if there are any causes for concern when the data is compiled.

Mr. LaFave reported the Public Safety Department would like to move forward with the purchase of body cameras to assist in efforts for transparency and to allow additional review of incidents, if needed. Cameras have not been purchased in the past due to budget constraints or policy/privacy concerns. Mr. LaFave felt these concerns have been alleviated and recommended amending the FY20-21 budget to accommodate this purchase.

Public Safety Director Herald reported on several meetings with residents concerned about bias in police operations, the lack of accurate historical data and moving forward with collecting the data for future analysis. He explained the department was exploring options for body cameras and hoped to have a recommendation within the next several weeks. Mr. Herald reviewed the many types of reports that are available from the department, including the use of force report, pursuits and internal investigations completed.

Mayor Favale opened public comment on this issue. The following people expressed their opinions:

- Abby Groff-Blaszak, 2360 Lake Drive

Requested the release of historical data as she felt there was enough data to use to understand what's happening during traffic stops. Disparity must be eliminated and historical information is needed to pinpoint practices and policies that need to change.

- Tina Murua, 1031 Lakeside

Thanked Public Safety for policy changes to collect data, but felt past data needs to be evaluated to find problem areas.

- Robert Blaszak, 2360 Lake Drive

Spoke about open policing projects that can use existing historical data to make assumptions and recommendations.

The following communications were received at City Hall concerning this variance request:

- Haley Raines, 2732 Albert

Supported analysis of historical data.

No other public comment was received. Mayor Favale closed the public hearing.

Commissioner Walters urged staff to continue working with residents on the release of historical data to those interested in researching the Public Safety Department's interactions with citizens.

Mayor Favale thanked the staff for working so quickly to implement new policies and training to facilitate the collection of data for future use.

2020-178. Duncan-Hamrick. To approve the consent agenda as follows:

2020-178-A. Minutes of the regular meeting held October 5, 2020.

2020-178-B. Payroll disbursements of \$240,386.24; county and school disbursements of \$64,305.17, and total remaining disbursements of \$147,316.47.

2020-178-C. Quarterly financial statements for the period ending June 30, 2020.

2020-178-D. Preliminary minutes of the Library Commission meeting held September 28, 2020.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7

Nays: -0-

2020-179. Mayor Favale reopened the meeting for public comment. No public comment was received.

The meeting adjourned at 7:49 p.m., subject to the call of the Mayor until November 2, 2020.

Karen K. Brower, City Clerk

Attachments: A – Resolution terminating participation in MERS defined benefit plan

Attachments listed above are available for inspection at the office of the City Clerk.

PROCEEDINGS OF THE CITY COMMISSION
CITY OF EAST GRAND RAPIDS

Regular Meeting Held November 2, 2020

Mayor Favale called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m. in the City Commission Chambers at the East Grand Rapids Community Center and led the audience in the Pledge of Allegiance. She announced the meeting was also being held electronically as allowed by the recent amendment to the Michigan Open Meetings Act in response to the COVID-19 crisis. She invited any citizen attending by computer or phone to ask questions or offer comments during the public comment times.

Present in Person: Commissioners Hamrick, Hecksel and Mayor Favale

Present Virtually: Commissioners Arendshorst, Duncan, Pachla and Walters

Absent: None

Also Present: City Attorney Huff; Interim City Manager LaFave; Finance Director Seath; Zoning Administrator Mizikar; Public Safety Director Herald; City Clerk Brower

2020-180. The agenda was approved as distributed.

2020-181. No public comment was received.

2020-182. Commissioners Hamrick and Hecksel reminded everyone to vote tomorrow.

Commissioners Pachla and Duncan thanked the Finance staff members who been working on election preparation and the Public Works employees who are working hard to stay on track with leaf pickup operations.

Commissioner Arendshorst gave an update on the number of absentee ballots returned for the Presidential election. He also thanked Parks & Recreation Director Bunn for creating digital Google maps of the parks, trails and amenities in East Grand Rapids for people to use when walking and biking in the city.

Mayor Favale reported the blood drive last week was well attended. She thanked the Public Safety Department for hosting their quarterly public engagement session on October 29 and for holding their annual open house for families on October 31.

2020-183. Fence variance hearing on the request of Mackinac LLC of 2951 Bonnell to allow the construction of a non-opaque masonry wall with two 4'6" pillars in the front yard.

Zoning Administrator Mizikar explained the request for a 24" solid brick wall with 4'6" pillars next to the driveway. He noted that although the fence was only 2' tall and there were no sight distance issues, the ordinances required any fence in the front yard to be at least 50% opaque.

City Attorney Huff noted the fence ordinance had been changed recently to add the variance procedure and standards similar to other zoning variance requests.

Rob Sears of Sears Architects explained that the wall varies from 16' to 21' from the sidewalk and the pillars will support a gate across the driveway. He noted the primary function of the wall, pillars and gate will be for security for the home.

Mayor Favale opened a public hearing. The following communications were received at City Hall concerning this variance request:

- Phil Stenger, 2945 Woodcliff Circle In Favor.
- Genevieve Swanson, 2945 Bonnell In Favor.
- Marney Davies, 2861 Bonnell In Favor.

No other public comment was received. Mayor Favale closed the public hearing.

Commissioner Arendshorst felt this request did not meet the standard for a practical difficulty contained in the ordinance.

2020-183-A. Pachla-Arendshorst. That the request of Mackinac LLC of 2951 Bonnell to allow the construction of a non-opaque masonry wall with two 4'6" pillars in the front yard be approved as outlined in the Zoning Administrator memo contained in the agenda materials.

Commissioner Pachla felt the wall generally meets the spirit of the ordinance requirements as it is very low and 16' from the property line and won't affect clear vision or snowplowing operations. Additionally, there are other brick walls with pillars in the area and this won't seem out of place.

Commissioner Arendshorst agreed the setback would make the wall unobtrusive yet would provide a measure of security as sought by the applicant.

Commissioner Walters noted the proposal did not meet the practical difficulty standard or the unique situation standard and he could not support the variance request. He felt the fence ordinance should be reviewed and revised to reflect these types of low fences and walls.

Commissioner Hamrick agreed. She felt this wall would not be a problem, but it doesn't meet the current standards for a variance so she would be voting against the motion.

Commissioner Duncan liked the look and feel of the fence, but agreed it doesn't meet the standards as there is no practical difficulty or unique situation.

Mayor Favale also agreed that three of the variance standards are not met with the current proposal, but felt the wall would be appropriate for the neighborhood and the situation. She noted other brick walls in the area were approved under earlier versions of the fence ordinance and agreed this should be looked at again.

Commissioner Walters suggested the Infrastructure Committee review the fence ordinance to define fences vs. decorative walls and to look at possibly allowing different types or height of fences at different setbacks from the street.

Mr. Sears asked that the variance request be tabled while the commission determines whether the ordinance needs to be changed to preserve his client's ability to make a revised request later.

2020-183-B. Pachla-Arendshorst. That the request of Mackinac LLC of 2951 Bonnell to allow the construction of a non-opaque masonry wall with two 4'6" pillars in the front yard be tabled indefinitely and to direct the Infrastructure Committee to review the provisions of Chapter 83 for possible revisions as noted above.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7
Nays: -0-

2020-184. Hecksel-Pachla. To approve the consent agenda as follows:

2020-184-A. Minutes of the regular meeting held October 19, 2020.

2020-184-B. Payroll disbursements of \$233,013.24; county and school disbursements of \$39,890.73, and total remaining disbursements of \$2,613,406.58.

2020-184-C. The purchase of two RIT Pak III units and two 60-minute self-contained breathing apparatus bottles from Westshore Inc. of Allendale in the amount of \$8,377.00.

2020-184-D. The purchase of five sets of firefighting turn-out gear from Appolo Fire Equipment of Romeo, Michigan in the amount of \$11,887.50.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7

Nays: -0-

2020-185. Mayor Favale reopened the meeting for public comment. No public comment was received.

The meeting adjourned at 6:45 p.m., subject to the call of the Mayor until November 16, 2020.

Karen K. Brower, City Clerk

PROCEEDINGS OF THE CITY COMMISSION
CITY OF EAST GRAND RAPIDS

Special Meeting Held November 13, 2020

Mayor Favale called the meeting to order at 8:12 a.m. in the City Commission Chambers.

Present in Person: Commissioners Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Mayor Favale

Absent: None

Also Present: City Attorney Huff; Interim City Manager LaFave; City Clerk Brower

2020-186. The agenda was approved as distributed.

2020-187. No public comment was received.

2020-188. City Clerk Brower gave a final update on the November 3, 2020 Presidential Election.

2020-189. Pachla-Arendshorst. Motion to enter into an executive session to review applications for the City Manager's position in accordance with Section 8(f) of the Open Meetings Act. A roll call vote was taken.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7

Nays: -0-

2020-190. The meeting recessed at 8:17 am to conduct the executive session. The meeting reconvened at 12:04 pm.

2020-191. Selection of candidates for interview.

2020-191-A. Pachla-Duncan. That candidate numbers 2, 26, 37, 38, 41 and 47 be invited to interview for the city manager's position.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7

Nays: -0-

2020-192. Meeting dates and details for candidate interviews.

2020-192-A. Duncan-Hamrick. That December 10 and December 11, 2020 be set as interview dates for the city manager's position with the schedule to be determined by the Michigan Municipal League in working with each candidate.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7

Nays: -0-

2020-193. The City Commission determined that virtual interviews and a virtual candidate meet-and-greet for the public would be appropriate given the rise in COVID-19 cases. The commission also asked that a public and employee survey be conducted to gather input on skills and traits desirable for the next city manager.

The meeting adjourned at 12:23 p.m., subject to the call of the Mayor until November 16, 2020.

Karen K. Brower, City Clerk

PROCEEDINGS OF THE CITY COMMISSION
CITY OF EAST GRAND RAPIDS

Regular Meeting Held November 16, 2020

Mayor Favale called the meeting to order at 6:01 p.m. in the City Commission Chambers at the East Grand Rapids Community Center and led the audience in the Pledge of Allegiance. She announced the meeting was also being held electronically as allowed by the recent amendment to the Michigan Open Meetings Act in response to the COVID-19 crisis. She invited any citizen attending by computer or phone to ask questions or offer comments during the public comment times.

Present in Person: Commissioners Hamrick and Mayor Favale

Present Virtually: Commissioners Arendshorst, Duncan, Hecksel, Pachla and Walters

Absent: None

Also Present: City Attorney Huff; Interim City Manager LaFave; Finance Director Seath; Zoning Administrator Mizikar; Public Safety Director Herald; City Clerk Brower

2020-194. The agenda was approved as distributed.

2020-195. Laura St. Louis of Disability Advocates outlined a new program offering free rides to veteran households for transportation to appointments. She invited everyone to learn more about the program and to volunteer.

2020-196. Commissioner Pachla urged all residents to read and abide by the new guidance provided by the Michigan Department of Health & Human Services regarding stopping the spread of COVID-19.

Interim City Manager LaFave reported the city has reviewed the new COVID-19 guidance and is adjusting operations accordingly. He noted Hall Street would be reconstructed in 2021 and residents are invited to look at plans online or at city hall and provide feedback.

City Clerk Brower provided a final update on the November 3 Presidential Election turnout and thanked the 50 precinct and absentee ballot counting board workers and the members of the Finance Department who worked so many hours this year to make all three elections happen smoothly.

Mayor Favale announced the next blood drive would be November 22 at the community center. She also reported that the COVID-19 Volunteer Task Force had been reactivated to assist families who may need assistance with running errands, doing yard work or paying bills due to the pandemic.

2020-197. Zoning variance hearing on the request of Patrick & Sonya Lincolnhol of 961 San Jose to allow the construction of an addition to the home creating a separation between the home and detached garage of 6'2" instead of the required 10'0."

Zoning Administrator Mizikar reviewed the request to construct an addition with a separation of 6'2" from the detached garage. He noted the separation requirement is for fire protection and maintenance access.

Mayor Favale opened a public hearing. The following communications were received at City Hall concerning this variance request:

- Paul & Rosanne Mack, 2025 Argentina In Favor.
- Sue & Patrick VanDuinen, 2020 Argentina In Favor.

No other public comment was received. Mayor Favale closed the public hearing.

2020-198. Walters-Pachla. That the request of Patrick & Sonya Lincolnhol of 961 San Jose to allow the construction of an addition to the home creating a separation between the home and detached garage of 6'2" instead of the required 10'0" be approved as outlined in the Zoning Administrator memo contained in the agenda materials.

Commissioner Walters noted this revised request was consistent with the discussion from the last meeting. He noted the corner lot setback creates an unusually small building envelope. He felt this was a good solution to avoid seeking a more substantial variance elsewhere on the lot.

Commissioner Pachla felt the location of the home on the lot makes it unusual and difficult to add on to the home within the ordinance requirements. He noted the neighbors supported the request.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7
Nays: -0-

2020-199. Doug Vredeveld of Vredeveld Haefner reviewed the audited financial statements for the fiscal year ended June 30, 2020 and answered questions from the City Commission.

2020-200. Purchase of body cameras and in-car video systems for Public Safety Department.

Public Safety Director Herald reviewed the proposal to add officer body cameras and replace the aging in-car video cameras that have been in place for years. The five-year contract will include the purchase, training, warranty for 28 body-worn cameras and 6 in-car video systems. The department is also working on a policy for the use of the cameras and will submit this policy to the commission for approval in December. He hopes to have the cameras operational in January.

2020-200-A. Hamrick-Duncan. A five-year contract with Axon Enterprises, Inc. of Scottsdale, Arizona totaling \$174,840.78 for the purchase and setup of 28 body-worn video cameras and six in-car video systems as outlined in the agenda materials.

Commissioner Walters noted the Finance Committee supported the purchase after an in-depth review.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7
Nays: -0-

2020-201. Pachla-Duncan. To approve the consent agenda as follows:

2020-201-A. Minutes of the regular meeting held November 2, 2020.

2020-201-B. Payroll disbursements of \$259,810.71; county and school disbursements of \$57,806.32, and total remaining disbursements of \$3,614,846.84.

2020-201-C. Resolution amending the FY 2020-21 budget for the period ending September 30, 2020 as attached in Exhibit "A."

2020-201-D. A contract with Groundhawg Excavating and Landscaping LLC not to exceed \$150,000 for the 2020-21 sidewalk rehabilitation and replacement program.

2020-201-E. The purchase of a 39-foot holiday tree from Wintergreen Corporation of Alpharetta, GA in the amount of \$19,951.10 in partnership with the Gaslight Village Business Association and funded by private donations.

2020-201-F. Preliminary minutes of the Parks & Recreation Commission meeting held October 12, 2020.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7
Nays: -0-

2020-202. Mayor Favale reopened the meeting for public comment. No public comment was received.

The meeting adjourned at 6:48 p.m., subject to the call of the Mayor until December 7, 2020.

Karen K. Brower, City Clerk

Attachments: A – Resolution amending the FY 2020-21 budget.
Attachments listed above are available for inspection at the office of the City Clerk.

PROCEEDINGS OF THE CITY COMMISSION
CITY OF EAST GRAND RAPIDS

Regular Meeting Held December 7, 2020

Mayor Favale called the meeting to order at 6:01 p.m. in the City Commission Chambers at the East Grand Rapids Community Center and led the audience in the Pledge of Allegiance. She announced the meeting was also being held electronically as allowed by the recent amendment to the Michigan Open Meetings Act in response to the COVID-19 crisis. She invited any citizen attending by computer or phone to ask questions or offer comments during the public comment times.

Present in Person: Commissioners Hamrick and Mayor Favale

Present Virtually: Commissioners Arendshorst, Duncan, Hecksel, Pachla and Walters

Absent: None

Also Present: City Attorney Huff; Interim City Manager LaFave; Finance Director Seath; Zoning Administrator Mizikar; Public Safety Director Herald; City Clerk Brower; City Assessor Hayes

2020-203. The agenda was approved as distributed.

2020-204. No public comment was received.

2020-205. Commissioner Hamrick reminded everyone of the meet and greet for city manager candidates tomorrow evening.

Commissioners Pachla and Duncan thanked Zoning Administrator Mizikar for his service to the residents of the city and wished him well in his new position with the City of Coopersville.

Commissioner Arendshorst thanked the residents who have taken the time to give input on the proposed improvements to Hall Street scheduled for the summer of 2021.

Commissioner Hecksel also encouraged residents to virtually meet the city manager candidates on Tuesday evening and fill out an online comment card with their impressions.

Mayor Favale announced the next blood drive would be December 21-23 and encouraged residents to sign up for an appointment. She also thanked Mr. Mizikar for all of his assistance to those with zoning questions and requests over the last several years and wished him well in his new job.

2020-206. Appointment of City Assessor.

Finance Director Seath introduced Stacey Hayes and highlighted her assessing experience and certifications to move into the Assessor position upon the retirement of Vicki VanderLugt in January.

2020-206-A. Hamrick-Walters. That Stacey Hayes be appointed as the City Assessor effective January 15, 2021.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7

Nays: -0-

2020-207. Land division request of Alan Buddendeck of 2204 Lake Drive to transfer 1,680 square feet to Nicholas & Sunny Jasinski of 2218 Lake Drive.

Zoning Administrator Mizikar explained the request to move the shared property line 15' to the north to increase the size of the property at 2218 Lake Drive. He noted that 2218 Lake Drive will be closer to the minimum size for the R-2 zoning district following the transfer.

Nick Jasinski, 2218 Lake Drive, explained the proposed shift to add additional square footage his lot.

Mayor Favale opened a public hearing. No other public comment was received. Mayor Favale closed the public hearing.

2020-207-A. Walters-Pachla. That the request of Alan Buddendeck of 2204 Lake Drive to transfer a 15'x112' piece of property containing 1,680 square feet to Nicholas & Sunny Jasinski of 2218 Lake Drive be approved as outlined in the Zoning Administrator memo contained in the agenda materials, with the following conditions:

8. The split complies with the surveys and legal descriptions presented in the land division application; and
9. The relevant deed(s) or land contract(s) be recorded with the Kent County Registrar of Deeds within 90 days of approval.

Commissioner Walters supported the request as outlined. Commissioner Pachla agreed, noting this brings one lot closer to conformity.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7
Nays: -0-

2020-208. Fence variance hearing on the request of AMDG Architects, representing the owners of 2750 Reeds Lake Blvd, to allow the construction of a driveway gate with 5' masonry pillars instead of the allowed 4.'

Zoning Administrator Mizikar outlined the request for a driveway gate with pillars taller than allowed by the zoning ordinance.

Brent Dykstra of AMDG Architects explained the taller pillars were needed to place the gate high enough to allow the inward swing without hitting the ground of the upward sloping driveway. He stated the applicants preferred the pillar and gate configuration requested rather than re-grade the driveway which would require removing trees and changing the drainage. Mr. Dykstra also stated the lights were proportional to the pillars and the overall height was appropriate.

Commissioner Hamrick questioned whether the pillars and gate could be moved toward the street to allow clearance for the gate to swing open. Mr. Dykstra stated the 32' from the road was to allow delivery vans to turn all the way into the driveway without hanging out into the street while waiting for the gates to open.

Mayor Favale opened a public hearing. The following communications were received at City Hall concerning this variance request:

- Jim O'Connor, 2630 Reeds Lake Ct	Wants construction finished.
- Mark Secchia, 2640 Reeds Lake Blvd	No objection.

No other public comment was received. Mayor Favale closed the public hearing.

2020-209. Walters-Hecksel. That the request of AMDG Architects, representing the owners of 2750 Reeds Lake Blvd, to allow the construction of a driveway gate with 5' masonry pillars instead of the allowed 4' to accommodate the gate clearance of 12" from grade be approved as outlined in the Zoning Administrator memo contained in the agenda materials.

Commissioner Walters stated he would support the request because of the slope of the driveway and the desire to avoid removing trees. He noted there were no close neighbors on either side and there were no clear vision issues with the request.

Commissioner Arendshorst agreed there was no safety issue, but felt this project could be done within the regulations.

Commissioner Pachla stated he did not see a practical difficulty in building a slightly different gate within ordinance requirements.

Yeas: Hecksel, Walters and Favale – 3
Nays: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick and Pachla – 4

- 2020-210. Zoning variance hearing on the request of Lucy & David Frey of 945 Plymouth to allow the construction of an addition to the rear of the home creating a rear yard setback of 18'4 $\frac{3}{8}$ " instead of the required 25.'

Zoning Administrator Mizikar explained the proposed project to convert a portion of the existing garage into a mudroom and an addition with another two garage stalls.

Tripp Frey, 945 Plymouth, explained his need for additional garage and storage space. He preferred to add on to the home rather than building a detached garage as he felt this would be less intrusive to the neighbors and meet his family's needs better.

Mayor Favale opened a public hearing. The following people were present to express their opinions:

- Barbara Hohman, 955 Plymouth Supported the request.

The following communications were received at City Hall concerning this variance request:

- Barbara Hohman, 955 Plymouth Supported the request.
- Bill & Rita Maddox, 939 Plymouth No objection.
- Michael & Jenny Fee, 950 Cambridge Supported the request.

No other public comment was received. Mayor Favale closed the public hearing.

Commissioner Walters questioned whether a smaller addition or a detached garage could accomplish the need for garage and storage space without requiring a variance. Mr. Frey stated they wanted room for three garage stalls and an additional bedroom above the garage. He also didn't feel a detached garage would be feasible given the layout of the lot.

Commissioner Pachla noted that while there may be other options that did not need a variance, the proposed garage made the best of the existing situation and would not be detrimental to the neighborhood.

Commissioner Walters agreed the proposal seemed reasonable, but he felt there were other options for a smaller variance or ways to accomplish the goals without a variance. Commissioner Arendshorst agreed.

Commissioner Duncan noted the desire for additional space was not a justification for granting a variance.

Commissioner Hecksel felt that special circumstances existed because the placement of the home so far north limited options for either an addition or a detached garage.

Commissioner Hamrick supported the request because it would fit the home and because of neighbor support.

Mayor Favale felt the request met the standards of the ordinance and would be most harmonious with the existing home and the neighborhood.

- 2020-211. Pachla-Hamrick. That the request of Lucy & David Frey of 945 Plymouth to allow the construction of an addition to the rear of the home creating a rear yard setback of 18'4 $\frac{3}{8}$ " instead of the required 25' be approved as outlined in the Zoning Administrator memo contained in the agenda materials.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla and Favale – 6
Nays: Walters – 1

- 2020-212. Introduction of an ordinance to amend Sections 1.220, 1.222, and 1.227 of Chapter 6 of Title I of the City Code pertaining to emergency powers of the mayor and city manager.

City Attorney Huff recommended adopting new provisions to the emergency powers ordinance to allow the mayor to declare a state of emergency to allow continuation of operations, if needed. He noted the revised sections mirror state law and will qualify a pandemic as an emergency.

- 2020-212-A. Pachla-Arendshorst. That an ordinance to amend Sections 1.220, 1.222, and 1.227 of Chapter 6 of Title I of the City Code pertaining to emergency powers of the mayor and city manager be adopted with an immediate effective date as attached in Exhibit "A."

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7
Nays: -0-

- 2020-213. Electric Vehicle Charging Station Agreement.

Interim City Manager LaFave outlined the proposal to install four electric vehicle charging stations in East Grand Rapids at no cost to the city. He noted two units will be installed in Gaslight Village and two at the Community Center. The city will receive a small portion of the revenue generated from the stations.

Commissioner Pachla hoped the location of the charging stations will be listed on websites, internet searches and mobile apps so that people know where to find them when needed.

Commissioner Hamrick and Mayor Favale thanked the staff for all the research that went into this agreement and looked forward to seeing them in use by members of the community.

- 2020-213-A. Hamrick-Duncan. To approve a five-year agreement with Hage Automotive of Detroit, Michigan for the placement of four electric vehicle charging stations at the Community Center and in Gaslight Village at no cost to the City.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7
Nays: -0-

- 2020-214. Traffic Calming Policy.

Interim City Manager LaFave reviewed the changes to the traffic calming policy used when working with residents regarding speeding or traffic complaints. The updated policy includes more detailed descriptions, steps used, and explanations of various terms and methods used for traffic calming. He noted the Infrastructure Committee had reviewed the policy in depth and recommends approval.

- 2020-214-A. Walters-Pachla. That an updated policy outlining the traffic calming policy process for residents and staff be adopted as attached in Exhibit "B."

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7
Nays: -0-

- 2020-215. Speed Cushion Placement Policy.

Interim City Manager LaFave explained the new policy outlined the purpose, objectives, conditions and requirements for the placement of speed cushions designed to slow traffic while allowing safe travel for bicycles and heavy equipment.

- 2020-215-A. Pachla-Duncan. That a policy for the use and placement of speed cushions as traffic calming devices in the city be adopted as attached in Exhibit "C."

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7
Nays: -0-

2020-216. Duncan-Hamrick. To approve the consent agenda as follows:

- 2020-216-A. Minutes of the special meeting held November 13, 2020.
- 2020-216-B. Minutes of the regular meeting held November 16, 2020.
- 2020-216-C. Payroll disbursements of \$497,095.80; county and school disbursements of \$12,014.64, and total remaining disbursements of \$263,762.87.
- 2020-216-D. Resolution electing to comply with the provisions of Public Act 152 of 2011 by exercising the city's right to exempt itself from the requirements of the Act as attached in Exhibit "D."
- 2020-216-E. A pilot program to convert existing gaslights on Wealthy, Bagley, Croswell and Lovett to LED fixtures using GR Electric, Inc. at a cost not to exceed \$6,900.00.
- 2020-216-F. Preliminary minutes of the Parks & Recreation Commission meeting held November 9, 2020.
- 2020-216-G. Preliminary minutes of the Planning Commission meeting held November 10, 2020.
 - Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7
 - Nays: -0-

2020-217. Mayor Favale reopened the meeting for public comment. No public comment was received.

The meeting adjourned at 8:04 p.m., subject to the call of the Mayor until December 21, 2020.

Karen K. Brower, City Clerk

Attachments: A – Ordinance amendment to Chapter 6 pertaining to emergency powers
B – Traffic Calming Policy
C – Speed Cushion Traffic Control Policy
D – Resolution exempting city from PA 152 provisions

Attachments listed above are available for inspection at the office of the City Clerk.

PROCEEDINGS OF THE CITY COMMISSION
CITY OF EAST GRAND RAPIDS

Special Meeting Held December 10, 2020

Mayor Favale called the meeting to order at 8:36 a.m. in the City Commission Chambers at the East Grand Rapids Community Center and led the audience in the Pledge of Allegiance. She announced the meeting was also being held electronically as allowed by the recent amendment to the Michigan Open Meetings Act in response to the COVID-19 crisis. She invited any citizen attending by computer or phone to ask questions or offer comments during the public comment times.

Present in Person: Commissioners Arendshorst, Duncan Hamrick, Hecksel and Walters and Mayor Favale

Present Virtually: Commissioner Pachla

Absent: None

Also Present: City Attorney Huff; City Clerk Brower

2020-218. The agenda was approved as distributed.

2020-219. No public comment was received.

2020-220. No commissioner reports were received.

2020-221. Kathie Grinzinger from the Michigan Municipal League reviewed the schedule of interviews and went over the interview questions and protocol in advance of the first interview.

2020-222. The City Commission interviewed two candidates for the position of Manager:

Shea Charles of Howell, Michigan
Benjamin Swayze of Ada, Michigan

2020-223. The meeting recessed from 12:06 p.m. to 12:37 p.m. for lunch.

2020-224. The City Commission interviewed two candidates for the position of Manager:

Jon DeYoung of Gallup, New Mexico
Jeffrey Durbin of Fraser, Colorado

The meeting adjourned at 3:49 p.m., subject to the call of the Mayor until December 11, 2020.

Karen K. Brower, City Clerk

PROCEEDINGS OF THE CITY COMMISSION
CITY OF EAST GRAND RAPIDS

Special Meeting Held December 11, 2020

Mayor Favale called the meeting to order at 8:57 a.m. in the City Commission Chambers at the East Grand Rapids Community Center and led the audience in the Pledge of Allegiance. She announced the meeting was also being held electronically as allowed by the recent amendment to the Michigan Open Meetings Act in response to the COVID-19 crisis. She invited any citizen attending by computer or phone to ask questions or offer comments during the public comment times.

Present in Person: Commissioners Arendshorst, Duncan Hamrick, Hecksel and Walters and Mayor Favale

Present Virtually: None

Absent: Commissioner Pachla

Also Present: City Attorney Huff; Interim City Manager LaFave; City Clerk Brower

2020-225. The agenda was approved as distributed.

2020-226. No public comment was received.

2020-227. Mayor Favale announced Commissioner Pachla would not be participating in today's interviews and discussion due to the birth of their second child early this morning. Commissioner congratulated the Pachla's on the new addition to their family.

2020-228. Kathie Grinzinger noted the final two interviews would take place this morning followed by deliberations this afternoon.

2020-229. The City Commission interviewed two candidates for the position of Manager:

Jonathan Seyferth of North Muskegon, Michigan
Adolfo Bailon of Randolph, Vermont

2020-230. The meeting recessed from 12:14 p.m. to 1:30 p.m. for lunch.

2020-231. The meeting reconvened at 1:30 p.m. with the following people present: Mayor Favale, Commissioners Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel and Walters, Interim City Manager LaFave, City Attorney Huff, City Clerk Brower, Finance Director Seath, Parks & Recreation Director Bunn, Public Safety Director Herald and MML Consultant Grinzinger (remote).

2020-232. Arendshorst-Hamrick. Motion to add to the agenda an executive session to discuss an attorney's opinion in accordance with Section 8(h) of the Open Meetings Act. A roll call vote was taken.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Walters and Favale – 6

Nays: -0-

2020-233. Selection of City Manager.

Mayor Favale thanked MML Consultant Grinzinger for overseeing the process and thanked all of the applicants who applied for the position. She also thanked the staff who interviewed the candidates last week and the community members who attended the meet and greet.

The mayor and commission discussed the interview process, the strengths of each candidate as well as skills and experience. Everyone felt it was a very difficult decision given the wealth of experience of those interviewed.

2020-233-A. Arendshorst-Hecksel. Motion to extend a conditional offer of employment to Shea Charles contingent upon background and reference checks.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Walters and Favale – 6
Nays: -0-

2020-233-B. Arendshorst-Walters. Motion to direct the city attorney to begin contract negotiations with Shea Charles for approval at an upcoming city commission meeting.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Walters and Favale – 6
Nays: -0-

2020-234. Walters-Hamrick. Motion to enter into an executive session to discuss an attorney's opinion in accordance with Section 8(h) of the Open Meetings Act. A roll call vote was taken.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Walters and Favale – 6
Nays: -0-

The meeting adjourned at 4:22 p.m., subject to the call of the Mayor until December 21, 2020.

Karen K. Brower, City Clerk

PROCEEDINGS OF THE CITY COMMISSION
CITY OF EAST GRAND RAPIDS

Regular Meeting Held December 21, 2020

Mayor Favale called the meeting to order at 6:01 p.m. in the City Commission Chambers at the East Grand Rapids Community Center and led the audience in the Pledge of Allegiance. She announced the meeting was also being held electronically as allowed by the recent amendment to the Michigan Open Meetings Act in response to the COVID-19 crisis. She invited any citizen attending by computer or phone to ask questions or offer comments during the public comment times.

Present in Person: Commissioners Hamrick and Mayor Favale

Present Virtually: Commissioners Arendshorst, Duncan, Hecksel, Pachla and Walters

Absent: None

Also Present: City Attorney Huff; Interim City Manager LaFave; Finance Director Seath; Public Safety Director Herald; City Clerk Brower; Sgt. Lindner, Public Safety Officer Wallace

2020-235. Mayor Favale asked that an executive session be added to the agenda.

2020-235-A. Hamrick-Arendshorst. Motion to add to the agenda an executive session to discuss an attorney's opinion in accordance with Section 8(h) of the Open Meetings Act. A roll call vote was taken.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7

Nays: -0-

2020-236. No public comment was received.

2020-237. Commissioner Walters thanked those who participated in the city manager search recently.

Commissioner Arendshorst expressed appreciation to all the residents who got involved in the city manager selection process and in the Hall Street project meetings.

Mayor Favale announced the blood drive continued through Wednesday at city hall and asked everyone to consider giving blood.

2020-238. Zoning variance hearing on the request of Matthew & Amelia Hayden, owners of 2727 Darby, to allow the construction of an accessory building between the Reeds Lake Blvd right-of-way and Reeds Lake.

Interim City Manager LaFave explained the zoning ordinance requires accessory buildings to be located in the rear yard, but with Reeds Lake Blvd running through the rear yard, a variance becomes necessary. He noted all other zoning standards are met.

Rob Sears of Sears Architects stated the building would be used for storage and kitchen/bath facilities. He noted there were many similar buildings in the area.

Mayor Favale opened a public hearing. The following communications were received at City Hall concerning this variance request:

- David & Leslie Hooker, 2747 Bonnell In Favor.

No other public comment was received. Mayor Favale closed the public hearing.

2020-238-A. Arendshorst-Hamrick. That the request of Matthew & Amelia Hayden, owners of 2727 Darby, to allow the construction of an accessory building between the Reeds Lake Blvd right-of-way and Reeds Lake be approved as outlined in the Zoning Administrator memo contained in the agenda materials.

Commissioner Arendshorst noted there were many homes with similar buildings along this roadway and a variance would not be needed without the road running through the property.

Commissioner Pachla supported the variance request per the zoning review outlined in the agenda materials.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7

Nays: -0-

- 2020-239. Zoning variance hearing on the request of Craig & Marissa Bilbrey of 1616 Robinson to allow the construction of an addition to the rear of the home creating a rear yard setback of 15'6" instead of the required 25'.

Interim City Manager LaFave outlined the request for a two-story addition containing living space and a two-car garage closer to the rear property line than allowed by the zoning ordinance.

Craig Bilbrey, 1616 Robinson, explained the request for additional bedrooms on the second floor and garage space below. He noted several of his neighbors support his request. Mr. Bilbrey and architect Aaron Taylor of Via Design answered several questions regarding options for a smaller addition or a detached garage in place of the proposed addition.

Mayor Favale opened a public hearing. No other public comment was received. Mayor Favale closed the public hearing.

- 2020-239-A. Pachla-Arendshorst. That the request of Craig & Marissa Bilbrey of 1616 Robinson to allow the construction of an addition to the rear of the home creating a rear yard setback of 15'6" instead of the required 25' be approved as outlined in the Zoning Administrator memo contained in the agenda materials.

Commissioner Pachla noted the alternative proposals did not meet the applicant's goals. He felt the request was a reasonable one and was a suitable use of the zoning variance procedure.

Commissioner Walters did not feel the request met the standards to grant a variance as it was not unique from others in the area. He also felt that a smaller addition could include a garage with a lesser variance or without needing a variance. Commissioner Duncan agreed.

Commissioner Hecksel felt it was a unique situation and that the standards were met.

Commissioner Hamrick understood the difficulty of working with an existing home and detached garage, but felt there were options to accomplish the goals with a smaller addition requiring a lesser variance. She did not feel the current proposal met the standards outlined in the variance.

Mayor Favale suggested possibly tabling the variance to give the applicant a chance to review the proposal in light of the commission's reservations about the project.

- 2020-239-B. Walters-Hamrick. That the request of Craig & Marissa Bilbrey of 1616 Robinson to allow the construction of an addition to the rear of the home be tabled to allow the applicant time to consult with his architect regarding the proposed addition.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7

Nays: -0-

- 2020-240. Hall Street Improvement Project.

Interim City Manager LaFave reported that Hall Street between Plymouth and Lake Drive would be resurfaced in 2021 and had been identified in the draft mobility plan for possible improvements for pedestrian and bicycle safety. Mr. LaFave outlined the many opportunities given to residents in recent weeks to provide input on the proposed plans and various options. None of the options include widening the road beyond the current width.

Ryan Arends of Moore & Bruggink Engineers outlined the four options:

- Option 1 eliminates parking to allow bike lanes, modifies existing bump-outs to include a slot through bike lane, extends the medians east of Breton to include the crosswalks, and relocates some crosswalks where necessary for accessibility requirements.
- Option 2 eliminates 22 parking spaces to allow a narrow bike lane but keeps the remaining parking, modifies existing bump-outs to include a slot through bike lane, extends the medians east of Breton and relocates some crosswalks.
- Option 3 is the same as #2 with the addition of a dedicated bike lane on the south side of the road from Plymouth to Lakeside.
- Option 4 is to leave all existing parking, bump-outs, medians and crosswalks and to only mill and resurface the street surface.

Interim City Manager LaFave noted the city could also choose to widen the roadway to allow bike lanes and parking the entire length at an added cost of approximately \$300,000.

Commissioner Arendshorst expressed concern about the safety of the slot through bike lanes in the bump-outs as he felt it was not safe for cyclists to be basically weaving in and out of the edge of the traffic lane which could catch drivers by surprise. Mr. LaFave explained this approach allowed for flexibility in the future if parking is ultimately removed in any of the locations in favor of bike lanes. Commissioner Walters was also concerned about potential safety problems of cyclists suddenly coming back to the roadway.

Commissioner Hamrick questioned what signage would be included to inform cyclists and motorists about using the new road features. Mr. Arends noted that pavement markings known as sharrows indicate where bikes should travel and physical upright signs can be placed intermittently alongside the roadway as needed.

Mayor Favale opened a public hearing. The following people were present to express their opinions:

- | | |
|------------------------------|--|
| - Tom Tilma, 1635 Hall | Suggested several additional options for bike lanes, parking and widening the roadway. |
| - Ken Pontius, 2102 Hall | Leave parking, no slot-through bumpouts. |
| - Paul Hegele, 2073 Hall | Didn't feel mobility plan was necessary or well thought out; parking is a need, bike lanes are a want, keep the parking. |
| - Nicholas Gumina, 2065 Hall | Wants parking left in front of his home, slot-through bike lanes are dangerous, ugly and won't be used. |

See the city commission agenda packet for correspondence received on the Hall Street options. Mayor Favale closed the public hearing.

Interim City Manager LaFave suggested a modified Option 3 that eliminated the slot-through bump-outs and reduced the intrusion of the bumpouts into the roadway to allow bikes to remain on the edge of the travel lane.

Commissioner Arendshorst reminded everyone that the master plan includes suggestions for improving mobility throughout the city, including the use of upgraded infrastructure and pavement markings. His goal was to balance the need for parking with the goal of making the city easier to traverse for pedestrians and cyclists. He felt the slot-through bumps could be dangerous and preferred to remove them from consideration. He preferred Option 3 without the slot through lanes or Option 1 with dedicated bike lanes.

Commissioner Walters also supported a modified Option 3 as he was not comfortable mixing the sharrows with the slot through lanes. He was open to discussing widening the road at some time in the future.

Commissioner Pachla felt keeping as much on street parking as possible was very important so he supported the modified Option 3 as suggested by Mr. LaFave. Commissioners Hecksel and Duncan agreed modified Option 3 would be a good compromise.

Commissioner Hamrick also felt the modified Option 3 was the best way to balance all the needs and wants.

2020-240-A. Hamrick-Pachla. That engineer's option #3, which includes keeping most on-street parking, adding sharrows, extending medians and modifying crosswalks be approved with the modification that slot through bike lanes be removed and bump-out depth be reduced to allow bikes to remain on the roadway without moving further into the traffic lane.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7
Nays: -0-

2020-241. Policy on Body Worn Cameras.

Interim City Manager LaFave reported the Public Safety Department will be implementing body-worn cameras in early 2021 and had developed a policy for the use of the cameras.

Public Safety Director Herald reviewed the highlights of the combined in-car and body-worn camera policy. He noted that videos would be randomly reviewed for training and improvement purposes, even if there were no complaints from the public. Mr. Herald reported the cameras and equipment had been delivered and the staff was working to set up training on the body cameras and the new in-car camera systems. Sergeant Lindner and Public Safety Officer Wallace answered questions on the programming and use of the cameras.

2020-242. Pachla-Arendshorst. To approve the consent agenda as follows:

2020-242-A. Minutes of the regular meeting held December 7, 2020.

2020-242-B. Minutes of the special meeting held December 10, 2020.

2020-242-C. Minutes of the special meeting held December 11, 2020.

2020-242-D. Payroll disbursements of \$223,410.34; county and school disbursements of \$44,248.95, and total remaining disbursements of \$248,878.06.

2020-242-E. Public Safety Quarterly Report for the period ending September 30, 2020.

2020-242-F. Blodgett Hospital Neighborhood Communication Report.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7
Nays: -0-

2020-243. Mayor Favale reopened the meeting for public comment. No public comment was received.

2020-244. Hamrick-Pachla. Motion to enter into an executive session to discuss an attorney's opinion in accordance with Section 8(h) of the Open Meetings Act. A roll call vote was taken.

Yeas: Arendshorst, Duncan, Hamrick, Hecksel, Pachla, Walters and Favale – 7
Nays: -0-

The meeting adjourned at 8:57 p.m., subject to the call of the Mayor until January 4, 2021.

Karen K. Brower, City Clerk